

From: BILL FORBES **M.F.I.P.P.A. Sec. 14 (1)**

Sent: Thursday, December 2, 2021 11:44 AM

To: clerks <clerks@oshawa.ca>

Subject: Fwd: 5052 harmony Rd N

Date: Wed, Dec 1, 2021 at 11:52 AM

Subject: 5052 harmony Rd N

To: Victoria White <Vwhite@oshawa.ca>, <wmunro@oshawa.ca>, <dcarter@oshawa.ca>, John Neal <jneal@oshawa.ca>, <rmcconkey@oshawa.ca>, <lindsey.park@pc.ola.org>, <erin.otoole@parl.gc.ca>, <minister.mah@ontario.ca>, <moshen.keyvani@ontario.ca>, <minister.mecp@ontario.ca>, <Tesfaye.Gebrezghi@ontario.ca>, **M.F.I.P.P.A. Sec. 14 (1)**

<Rwarne@kawarthaconservation.com>, Chris Jones <cjones@cloca.com>, <citycouncil@oshaw.ca>

It appears that some people are not aware of the connection between the 1515 Thornton Rd N Digestate Facility and 5052 Harmony Rd N Digestate trial site for Digestate material proposal..

Both of these sites are owned by RIC; as in RIC (EOR) Inc. for the Thornton site and RIC (Harmony) Inc. Harmony site and Evergreen Environmental Inc. all of which are collocated at 162 Cumberland St, Suite 600, Toronto, On.

I would like to advise that Roddy Ornella, Senior officer of the MECP, advised me, by email, on Sept 10, 2021 that it was the Ministry's understanding that Evergreen would be using the Harmony site for co-composting digestate material from the Thornton facility if their "Trial" was successful and once it is operational. We also understand that Evergreen has the right to assess the trial's success or failure.

I have attached the email for your review and records. - see note #5 - MECP Roddy Omella - He confirms that there is a plan to use 5052 Harmony N as a composting area for Digestate material from the 1515 Thornton Digestate Facility - Oshawa (Note Thornton Digestate Facility can produce 175,000 tonnes/Year of Digestate material from the Ontario area based on the ECA approval for Thornton)

Also see note #1 - We wonder who in the MECP agreed to a 1 KM notification rule for 11 neighbors .- notified on a single sheet of paper - to 11 homes at Raglan/Harmony N - for a dump site.

Also see note #1- He states that only CLOCA is responsible for this site. This is incorrect. Kawartha Conservation is responsible for the north part of the Harmony site according to CLOCA.

Bill Forbes NOTE reply from Roddy Ornella - MECP
Senior Environmental Officer Badge 1418
Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks
Drinking Water and environmental
Compliance Division
York-Durham District Office
905 424 1390

Roddy Ornella reports to - Kristen Sones, Supervisor, York Durham District Office
Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks (MECP) 416-629-2128

Ornella, Roddy (MECP) <Roddy.Ornella@ontario.ca> Fri, Sep 10, 2:18 PM
to John, Chris, Kristen, mharrington@oshawa.ca, me, Victoria

Greetings Mr. Forbes,

Thank you for your email. My answers to your concerns are in red.

Stay well,
Roddy,

Areas of concern (current)

1) Notification plan request of the Ministry for contacting residents and business within a 1 km radius is in adequate given the nature of the neighbourhood and the site location on the Oak Ridges Moraine. An expansion of the notification radius and additional notifications should have been made to the City of Oshawa, Central Lake Ontario Conservation Authority and Kawartha Conservation Watershed, given their responsibility for managing under the Oak Ridges Moraine Plan and more specifically section 47.1 of the plan and the specific municipal zoning of the site. **The notification plan request of 1km is a standard capture zone given the nature of this proposed pilot project and was agreed upon during the pre-consultation meeting between the Ministry and the company earlier this year. The Ministry did notify the City of Oshawa and CLOCA of the project. The Ministry has had and will continue to have active correspondence about the pilot project with both agencies. Oshawa falls under CLOCA jurisdiction not Kawartha CA.**

2) You're directing us to speak directly with Evergreen and indeed, advising Evergreen of our communication with you is boarding on unacceptable. We came to you for your answers about what the Ministry's involvement with the proposal is and not to be redirected elsewhere. **I am sorry you feel that way Mr. Forbes. The Ministry's role will be two parts. The Ministry's Permission Branch will review the ECA submission as well as taking into consideration comments/concerns received from the public and other agencies. If the Permission's Branch decides to approve/issue the ECA to Evergreen,**

the Area Officer (myself) will monitor/inspect the operations for compliance with the conditions in said ECA and Provincial Legislation. As it stands, the Ministry has not received the ECA application submission from Evergreen so I thought it best that Evergreen answer your additional questions regarding technical details around the proposed project at this time. The Ministry has advised Evergreen to record and respond to all comments/questions from the public and provide those correspondence to the Ministry in an effort for transparency during the notification phase of the proposal.

3) Given the historic misuse of the site by the previous owner and the apparent lack of monitoring/action by the Ministry for many years, is anyone at the Ministry monitoring the clean up of this and has a timeline been provided for this? How will site monitoring take place for any future activity at the site (for current use and (God forbid an ECA is issued) future use? Although I cannot speak for the previous owner or their historic management of the Harmony Road Site, I can speak to the current clean-up activities at the site. Now that the site is out of receivership and under new ownership, the Ministry has requested that the pulp and paper biosolids be removed from the site. The Ministry is currently working with the company to ensure all applicable permits are in place for removal and deposition of the material at an approved receiving site. The Ministry will continue to monitor the site for compliance with Provincial Legislation and continue to actively engage Evergreen when abatement measures need to be taken.

Areas of concern (future ECA application)

4) The proposal is apparently for a trial of 1 year. What types of success criteria will be put in place, how will they be monitored and if achieved what will be the process for a second ECA to be approved? Will a second ECA be for the same site? You are correct, the current research and development pilot project temporary ECA (if granted by the Ministry) will be applicable for 1 year. If an ECA is issued by the Ministry, I will be inspecting the operations to ensure compliance with the ECA and Provincial legislation. If Evergreen wishes to continue the operations (at 5052 Harmony road or at another site) beyond the 1 year trial period, they will have to submit a new ECA application.

5) Is this proposal linked to the RIC (Thornton)/Evergreen ECA application for the Thornton Road Biodigester facility? It is the Ministry's understanding that if the pilot project is successful, Evergreen will eventually utilize the Anaerobic Digestate from 1515 Thornton Road Anaerobic Digester once it is fully operational. Both sites are owned by RIC. As mentioned in concern 4, a new ECA application will be required after the 1 year trial should Evergreen wish to continue the operations.

6) As the proposed trial is a TRIAL how will the Ministry be involved in monitoring the project: planning, execution to plan and most importantly monitoring potential impacts to the environment. (see answer to concern 2)

7) Part of the trial is to use open air windrow composting, how will monitoring be conducted for such as a. run off, a pond is located on the south portion of the site
b. odour,

c. changes in wildlife populations (mice, rats, coyotes, bears etc.) (i.e. increase in population due to potential new food sources) and the impacts of this on local farms (beef, dairy, sheep, grain) and increase in potential danger to people and pets. **If an ECA is issued by the Ministry, there will be conditions to ensure the protection of the natural environment. These conditions will be reviewed and assessed through inspections and site visits during the duration of the 1 year trial period.**

8) Finally, we are concerned that this proposal will be rubber stamped, because it will take place in a rural area, with few neighbours and is being pushed by a large set of interrelated companies with big lobbying power irrespective of impacts on the Oak Ridges Moraine or the people who live here. **The application will undergo a detailed review by the Ministry. The Ministry has also requested Evergreen to submit a copy of the ECA application to the City of Oshawa and CLOCA to ensure compliance with all applicable legislation.**

Roddy Ornella

Senior Environmental Officer, Badge #1418

Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks

Drinking Water and Environmental Compliance Division

Division de la conformité en matière d'eau potable et d'environnement

York-Durham District Office

(P) 905-424-1390 *NEW*

(Spills Action Centre) 1-800-268-6060

NOTE: This message is confidential and may be privileged and exempt from disclosure under applicable law. If you are not the intended recipient or an agent of that individual or organization, any use, copying, or distribution of this message by you is strictly prohibited. If you received this communication in error, please contact me by return e-mail and delete this message. We want to hear from you. How was my service? You can provide feedback at 1-888-745-8888. Thank you.