

To: Community and Operations Services Committee

From: Kevin Alexander, Commissioner,
Community and Operations Services Department

Report Number: CO-24-26

Date of Report: April 10, 2024

Date of Meeting: April 15, 2024

Subject: Enhanced Green Bin Program Update and Multi-Residential
Organics Collection Options

Ward: All Wards

File: 03-05

1.0 Purpose

The purpose of this report is to provide an update on the enhanced Green Bin Program and multi-residential organics collection options and to obtain Council's direction on the next steps.

Attachment 1 is a Report from the Region of Durham, dated December 6, 2023 titled "Organics Management Plan – Multi-Residential Enhanced Green Bin Program" ("Report #2023-WR-9").

Attachment 2 is a Multi-Residential Organics Collection Program – Estimated Cost Comparison.

2.0 Recommendation

That the Community and Operations Services Committee recommend to City Council:

That the Community and Operations Services Committee select an option as detailed in Section 5.3 of Report CO-24-26 "Enhanced Green Bin Program Update and Multi-residential Organics Collection Options" dated April 10, 2024.

3.0 Executive Summary

Not applicable.

4.0 Input From Other Sources

- Corporate Communications

- Finance Services
- Legal Services
- Legislative Services
- Region of Durham
- Corporate Leadership Team

5.0 Analysis

5.1 Background

The City of Oshawa (“City”) has actively participated in the residential curbside green bin collection program since its implementation in 2006. The City currently provides curbside organics (“green bin”) collection to single-family dwellings and low density multi-residential buildings (8 units or less). Medium to higher density multi-residential buildings (greater than 8 units) were not part of the original green bin roll out.

The Region of Durham (“Region”) is responsible for managing the processing and disposal of materials collected under the City’s collection program and has historically been responsible for promotion, education and the supply of diversion kits to new and existing home owners. The City works closely with the Region to align local efforts with regional initiatives.

In March 2023, Regional Council authorized an “Enhanced Green Bin” program to expand the list of acceptable items allowed in the green bin and to extend the program to include multi-residential buildings that are approved for municipal waste collection services. The Enhanced Green Bin program aligns with the Oshawa Strategic Plan goal of less waste generation as well as the [Region’s Long-term Waste Management Plan](#) that aims to increase the diversion of organics from disposal. Increasing the diversion of organics also helps to achieve diversion targets set by the [Province as part of the Ontario Food and Organic Waste Policy Statement](#). The Policy Statement establishes waste reduction and resource recovery targets including 70 per cent diversion of organic waste from single-family homes by 2023 and 50 per cent diversion of organic waste from multi-residential buildings by 2025.

On June 26, 2023, Council considered [Report CO-23-34](#) dated June 7, 2023 and adopted the following recommendation:

- “1. That based on Report CO-23-34, dated June 7, 2023, concerning the Enhanced Green Bin Program, staff be authorized to work with the Region of Durham’s Waste Management Division on the coordination of the enhanced green bin program; and,
2. That staff review the roles and responsibilities as it relates to the provision of waste collection services including green bin collection at multi-residential buildings;
3. That staff report back on the outcome of the discussions with the Region; and,

4. That the City of Oshawa's Waste Collection By-law 11-2008, as amended, be further amended to reflect the organics management program changes pending further discussions with the Region of Durham.”

5.2 Expanded Green Bin Materials – Curbside Collection Program

Starting July 1, 2024, and in alignment with the Region of Durham, the City's curbside green bin collection program will be accepting diapers, adult incontinence products, pet waste and pet litter as well as other related material. Residents must use compostable Green Bin liners for all items, including pet waste. Amendments to the Waste Collection By-law 113-2008 will be required to capture the program changes as was outlined in [Report CO-23-34](#) dated June 7, 2023.

The Region will be initiating an enhanced green bin communication campaign that will run across the Region from June 2024 to the end of August 2024. This campaign will focus on raising awareness about the new materials accepted as part of the curbside green bin program. The City will share and amplify the Region's communications using a variety of communications tactics and communications channels. Additionally, City staff will work with the Region on specific messaging, as required.

The City will continue with curbside collection of green bins on a weekly basis. Residents will be able to place unlimited green bins at the curb, but each green bin must not exceed 20 kg (44 lbs) in weight. To help residents comply with the weight limit, the Region will subsidize 50% of the cost of extra bins per address for the rest of 2024. Based on the Region's approved budget, for the remainder of 2024 residents will be able to purchase one additional bin (per address) for \$9.50.

5.3 Implementation of a Multi-Residential Green Bin Collection Program

On December 22, 2023, Regional Council endorsed the recommendations contained in Report #2023-WR-9 “Organics Management Plan – Multi-Residential Enhanced Green Bin Program” on the implementation of a multi-residential source separated organics collection program and associated measures to ensure the success of the program (Attachment 1).

The assessment conducted by the Region on the "readiness" of current multi-residential structures in Oshawa, as provided in Table 1, concluded that a phased, multi-year strategy is essential for the integration of the organics collection program. The Region's evaluation pinpointed those sites that could seamlessly initiate collection as "Green," indicating near-term execution. In contrast, sites necessitating minor modifications were marked as "Yellow," signifying a medium-term rollout, and those requiring substantial site renovations were classified as "Red," implying a more extended range plan for implementation.

Table 1: Readiness Review

Readiness Level	Buildings	Dwelling Units	# of totes (estimated)*
Green	123	6630	332
Yellow	84	5795	290
Red	13	756	38
Total	220	13181	660

*Note: the # of totes does not consider locations where it would be more appropriate to have front-end service. Totes were estimated based on the number of dwelling units: 1 tote/20 units

The multi-residential organics collection program must also take into consideration future growth as development is shifting towards more medium and high-density forms of housing including condominium townhouses and apartments. In order for multi-residential developments to receive municipal collection services, they will be required to meet waste and organic design guidelines. The design guidelines for new developments are needed to ensure proper vehicle access, storage and capacity for waste and organic collection.

5.3.1 Option A: Region of Durham operates the multi-residential program on behalf of the City

Regional Council endorsed the recommendation that the Region of Durham assume the responsibility for the overall management of the multi-residential organics program in Oshawa and Whitby as part of a shared-service agreement. Under this proposal the Region would contract out the collection of multi-residential organics to a private contractor. The contractor would be responsible for working with property owners and managers to determine the appropriate level and type of service (front-end or tote collection) for each building. As part of the Region’s contract, the contractor would be responsible for providing, cleaning, and maintaining the organics bins or totes to ensure that the program is well received. The Region would also be responsible for providing education and outreach to residents as well as supplying kitchen containers for each dwelling unit. As part of the shared service agreement the Region would invoice the City of Oshawa for all costs associated with the program including the promotion, education and supply of kitchen containers.

Advantages:

- The Region can leverage economies of scale by incorporating Oshawa’s dwellings which benefits all Region of Durham residents.
- Risk associated with the program would be transferred to the Region.
- The City would not have to invest in additional staff, equipment, or infrastructure to provide the service.

- The Region would handle all aspects of customer service, education, and enforcement related to the multi-residential organics program including establishing design criteria for new developments which would be consistent across the Region.
- Costs will be phased-in over time based on the Region’s “readiness” review and contractor’s implementation schedule, pending award.
- Supports the Environmental goals of the City.

Disadvantages:

- Costs will increase as new service locations are approved for municipal waste collection services.

This option balances cost-effectiveness, service quality, and environmental benefits. It also leverages the existing expertise and resources of the Region and avoids duplication of efforts. If this option is selected, the City would work closely with the Region to ensure that the program meets the needs and expectations of residents and stakeholders. The City will still be responsible for providing garbage collection services at these same locations.

If the Community and Operations Committee selects Option “A”, the following recommendation should be adopted:

That the Community and Operations Committee recommend to City Council:

- “1. That pursuant to Report CO-24-26 dated April 10, 2024 staff be authorized to negotiate the terms of the shared use agreement with the Region in a form and content acceptable to the Commissioners of Community and Operations Services, Corporate and Finance Services and the City Solicitor; and,
2. That Council pass a by-law to further amend the Waste Collection By-law 113-2008, as amended, to allow for the changes in the expanded green bin program as outlined in Report CO-24-26 dated April 10, 2024 and in a form and content acceptable to the Commissioners of Community and Operations Services, Corporate and Finance Services and the City Solicitor.”

5.3.2 Option B: City of Oshawa Collection Program

The City of Oshawa currently provides waste collection at multi-residential properties approved for municipal waste collection services. City serviced multi-residential customers receive either front-end collection through a contracted service provider or curbside waste collection by city forces. Under this option, the City of Oshawa would be responsible for implementing organics collection program at these same locations.

To undertake multi-residential organics collection services in-house the City would have to hire additional staff resources and purchase new fleet assets capable of collecting organics from medium density apartments that could accommodate a tote based collection system.

For high density buildings, where a tote based program is not practical from a collection or storage perspective, the City will need to integrate organics collection as part of its existing front-end collection contract.

The City would be responsible for administering the program including liaising with property owners and managers, educating residents, and enforcing the program.

Advantages:

- The City would have full control over the design, delivery, and cost of the service.
- Supports the Environmental goals of the City.

Disadvantages:

- The City's governance over the initiative is constrained, given that the bulk of the program's directives and processing mandates fall under the jurisdiction of the Region.
- The City would have to incur significant capital and operating costs to provide the service.
- The City would have to manage all aspects of customer service, implementation, and enforcement related to the program. This may require additional administrative support.
- The City would not be able to provide the high level of service proposed by the Region for the cleaning and repairing of the totes. Property managers would be responsible for maintaining and replacing the totes, this could impact the success of the program for those existing buildings.
- Property owners would be responsible for purchasing and maintaining all organic bins or totes.
- The City will still need to contract out services for high density buildings which require a different level of service by a contractor for front-end collection.
- Costs will increase as new service locations are approved for municipal waste collection services.

If the Community and Operations Committee selects Option "B", the following recommendation should be adopted:

That the Community and Operations Committee recommend to City Council:

- "1. That staff be directed to proceed with phasing in the implementation of an organics collection program for multi-residential buildings and the development of design standards for new or redeveloped buildings as detailed in Section 5.3.2 of Report CO-24-26 dated April 10, 2024; and,

2. That Council pass a by-law to further amend the Waste Collection By-law 113-2008, as amended, to allow for the changes in the expanded green bin program as outlined in Report CO-24-26 dated April 10, 2024 and in a form and content acceptable to the Commissioners of Community and Operations Services, Corporate and Finance Services and City Solicitor.”

5.3.3 Option C: No Multi-Residential Organics Collection Program

This option is status quo in which case neither the Region nor the City provides for the collection of organics from Multi-residential buildings. Residents would continue disposing of their organic waste in the garbage.

Updates to the City’s Waste Collection By-law 113-2008, as amended, are required to allow for the expansion of the green bin program including servicing and set out requirements to align with the Region of Durham.

Advantages:

- The City would not have to incur any costs or responsibilities related to providing organics collection service.
- The City would avoid potential issues or complaints related to organics collection (such as odor, pests, contamination, or bin storage).

Disadvantages:

- The City would miss an opportunity to increase its waste diversion rate.
- The City would not meet the expectations or needs of some residents who want to participate in organics diversion.
- The City may face pressure or criticism from environmental groups or other stakeholders who advocate for the diversion of organics from disposal.
- The City would not comply with Provincial Policy Statement.

If the Community and Operations Committee selects Option “C”, the following recommendation should be adopted:

That the Community and Operations Committee recommend to City Council:

- “1. That pursuant to Report CO-24-26 dated April 10, 2024 that the Region be notified that the initiative is not a Legislative requirement and due to the potential cost of the program the City of Oshawa is not recommending the implementation of a multi-residential organics program at this time; and,
2. That Council pass a by-law to further amend the Waste Collection By-law 113-2008, as amended, to allow for the changes in the expanded curbside green bin program as outlined in [Report CO-23-34](#) dated June 7, 2023 and in a form and content

acceptable to the Commissioners of Community and Operations Services, Corporate and Finance Services and Legal Services.”

6.0 Financial Implications

The estimated financial implications for each option are outlined in Attachment 2 and summarized below:

Option “A”: The Region estimates that it would cost \$141,680 as a one-time fee to roll out the program, and \$958,450 annually to operate it. The City would be invoiced by the Region for the cost of the program. This cost will be phased in as on-boarding of existing buildings is undertaken and will increase overtime with growth as new service locations are approved for municipal waste collection services.

Option “B”: In order for the City to assume multi-residential organics collection services a capital budget of \$730,000 would be required to purchase an additional fleet asset, organics totes and undertake a promotion and education campaign necessary for the roll-out of the program.

The City estimates that it would cost approximately \$500,000 annually to operate an organics tote collection program for small to medium sized buildings. This includes fleet related operating costs, ongoing promotion and education, supply of kitchen containers, as well as additional staff resources to implement and undertake collection services.

Option “C”: The City would not incur any direct costs related to this option. However, there may be indirect costs to the Region related to processing at the Durham York Energy Centre that may be incurred.

7.0 Relationship to the Oshawa Strategic Plan

This report addresses the goals set out in the Oshawa Strategic Plan of Economic Prosperity and Financial Stewardship and Environmental Responsibility.



Mike Saulnier, Director,
Operations Services



Kevin Alexander, Commissioner,
Community and Operations Services Department

If this information is required in an accessible format, please contact 1-800-372-1102 ext. 3540.



The Regional Municipality of Durham Report

To: Works Committee
From: Acting Commissioner of Works
Report: #2023-WR-9
Date: December 6, 2023

Subject:

Organics Management Plan – Multi-Residential Enhanced Green Bin Program

Recommendation:

That the Works Committee recommends to Regional Council:

- A) That staff be authorized to implement a Multi-Residential Green Bin Collection Program for multi-residential buildings already receiving regional waste collection services;
- B) That the Commissioner of Works be authorized to enter into a Shared Services Agreement with the Town of Whitby and the City of Oshawa outlining the framework under which the Regional Municipality of Durham may operate a region-wide Multi-Residential Green Bin Collection Program, including within the Town of Whitby and the City of Oshawa, subject to the satisfaction of the Commissioner of Finance and the Regional Solicitor;
- C) That the Commissioner of Works be authorized to amend By-Law #46-2011, a By-Law to Regulate the Provision of Waste Management Services Under the Jurisdiction of the Regional Municipality of Durham to reflect the necessary program changes;
- D) That the estimated annual gross program cost of \$1.9 million (\$0.95 million in 2025), with costs of approximately 50.6 per cent and 16.0 per cent based on the number of units, be recovered from the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby respectively.

- E) That the net cost to the Region be included in the 2025 and future Waste Management Business Plans and Budgets; and
 - F) That a copy of this report be distributed to Local Area Municipalities and the Ontario Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks York-Durham District Office for information.
-

Report:**1. Purpose**

- 1.1 The purpose of this report is to seek Regional Council's approval to implement a multi-residential source-separated organics collection program and associated measures to ensure the success of the program.

2. Background

- 2.1 On March 1, 2023, Regional Council approved Report [#2023-WR-3](#), which outlined the next steps for the development of a Green Bin program for multi-residential buildings already receiving municipal waste collection services.
- 2.2 Currently, the Region provides recycling and garbage collection to 419 multi-residential properties (26,262 dwelling units), as noted in Table 1 below. Multi-residential buildings that do not meet the Region's requirements manage their waste with private contracts.
- 2.3 The Region does not have a multi-residential Green Bin program. The multi-residential sector is the fastest growing housing sector in the Region, and multi-residential organics, which account for approximately 44 per cent of the garbage collected from multi-residential properties, represent the best opportunity for the Region for additional waste diversion beyond expanding the curbside Green Bin program.

Table 1: Multi-residential properties serviced by the Region (September 2023)

Municipality	# of Multi-residential Properties Serviced	# of Individual Units Serviced
Oshawa	221	13,309
Whitby	76	4,207
Pickering	36	3,661
Ajax	34	3,124
Clarington	27	1,067
Uxbridge	15	511
Scugog	4	138
Brock	6	245
TOTAL	419	26,262

- 2.4 As each building is unique, the proposed multi-residential green bin program will require a multi-year implementation to allow for the changes needed to accommodate the program in each building. This is especially true for buildings with limited storage capacity. No building retrofits are anticipated, and required changes will be related to individual property management practices.
- 2.5 New multi-residential projects currently in the development review process will be informed of the upcoming changes with a request for appropriate site accommodations. Organics management will be included in the Region's future multi-residential development review process.
- 2.6 The Region processes all curbside green bins collected in Durham, except in, the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby, which collect the curbside Green Bin materials in their respective municipalities. The Region will collect organics from multi-residential properties in the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby under a shared services agreement for the proposed multi-residential Green Bin program. The agreement will outline the provisions under which the Region will recover

from the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby their respective share of the program's total costs.

3. Previous Reports and Decisions

- 3.1 In June 2019, Regional Council approved Report [#2019-COW-17](#), which outlined the 'Organics Management Next Steps and Updated Preliminary Business Case' to adopt wet AD as the preferred technology for the Region's long-term organics management plan to maximize diversion, including Green Bin organics and the organic fraction of mixed garbage wastes.
- 3.2 In June 2022, Regional Council approved Report [#2022-COW-22](#), authorizing staff to cancel the Region's Mixed Waste Pre-sort and Anaerobic Digestion Facility ("AD Project") procurement process in accordance with the requirements of the Negotiated Request for Proposal, NRFP 1080-2021 ("NRFP").
- 3.3 In March 2023, Regional Council approved Report [#2023-WR-3](#), authorizing staff to launch a Region-wide Enhanced Green Bin program to expand the list of acceptable items in the current program. Regional Council also granted approval to develop a Green Bin program for multi-residential properties receiving regional waste collection services and make respective amendments to By-Law #46-2011.

4. Ontario Food and Organic Waste Policy Statement

- 4.1 Ontario's Food and Organic Waste Policy Statement (Policy Statement) requires municipalities to achieve:
 - a. 70 per cent waste reduction and resource recovery of food and organic waste generated by single-family dwellings in urban settlement areas by 2023; and
 - b. 50 per cent waste reduction and resource recovery of food and organic waste generated at multi-residential properties by 2025.
- 4.2 It also encourages the diversion of the following materials through organics separation programs:
 - a. Personal hygiene waste,
 - b. Sanitary products,
 - c. Shredded paper (already accepted in the Region's program)
 - d. Additional paper products (already accepted in the Region's program),

- e. Compostable products and packaging,
 - f. Pet food (already accepted in the Region's green bin) and;
 - g. Pet waste.
- 4.3 In 2021, the Region diverted 43 percent of the available organics, including leaf and yard waste materials into the single-family home waste stream. A multi-residential Green Bin program will improve this performance and help the Region achieve compliance with Ontario's Food and Organic Waste Policy Statement.
- 5. Existing Approved Multi-Residential Building Inspections**
- 5.1 Regional staff inspected the 419 approved multi-residential properties to assess the level of effort required to implement the proposed multi-residential Green Bin Collection Program. Based on these inspections, each property was classified into three categories of readiness to receive the program as follows:
- a. Ready to implement - The property has adequate space, infrastructure, and staff to manage organic waste and has clear guidelines and incentives for residents to participate in the program and reduce contamination. The property can start the program with minimal changes to its processes.
 - b. Minor changes required - The property may need to make some adjustments or improvements to optimize the process, may also need to update its guidelines and incentives for residents and would benefit from more education and outreach. The property can start the program with moderate changes to its processes.
 - c. Significant site challenges - The property has limited or no space, infrastructure, or staff to deal with organic waste. The property may face physical, logistical, or financial barriers to implement the program, may also have low awareness or engagement from residents, and may see resistance from property management. The property owner would require significant changes to its processes to start the program.
- 5.2 Property managers and owners were given an opportunity to provide their insights for implementing the proposed multi-residential Green Bin program.
- 5.3 The inspections confirm that 64 percent of buildings are ready to implement a multi-residential green bin program, 32 per cent can implement with minor changes, and 4 per cent may face significant site challenges. This information will inform the phased-in implementation plan. Any costs associated with ensuring that properties can accommodate the program will be the responsibility of the property owner.

6. Other Municipal Multi-Residential Green Bin Programs

- 6.1 Halton Region, the City of Hamilton, the City of Ottawa, and the City of Toronto have implemented multi-residential Green Bin programs. Regional staff spoke with representatives from these municipalities to learn from their experiences. The findings are outlined in Attachment #1.
- 6.2 These municipalities have design standards to facilitate the separation of organic waste, including tri-sorters, bi-sorters, three-chute systems, and waste storage facilities. They also offer options for collecting organic waste, such as, wheeled tote containers ranging in size from 121 – 360 litres (32-95 gallons) and 1.8 cubic metres (2-yard) front-end bins. The number and size of bins allocated per building depend on the number of units in each building.
- 6.3 Staff have solicited proposals for the design and delivery of a multi-residential Green Bin collection program from the industry. The proposals received include similar features as those described above, including providing kitchen catcher containers and respective information/instructions to residents, using wheeled tote containers for centralized collection and weekly collection at a minimum, with a twice-weekly collection schedule for larger properties.
- 6.4 The most common lesson learned from all municipalities is that program success depends on maintaining a comprehensive education and compliance campaign to ensure effective program participation. An annual promotional budget between \$2.28 and \$6.50 per dwelling unit is recommended for ongoing program success. Appropriate costs will be Regional with cost recovery from Whitby and Oshawa through the recommended Shared Services Agreement.

7. Shared Services Agreement with the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby

- 7.1 Regional staff are jointly developing a Shared Services Agreement with the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby, which will outline the provisions under which the Region will deliver a multi-residential Green Bin program in the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby and basis by which the Region will allocate and recover the costs of the program from the Town of Whitby and the City of Oshawa.
- 7.2 The intent of the shared services agreement is to recognize program efficiencies and cost benefits through administration of a single consistent program across the Region under a single contract. The program will also be able to leverage

consistent common messaging to residents and bring the communities into alignment with Ontario's Food and Organic Waste Policy Statement.

7.3 The City of Oshawa Council has approved Report [CO-23-34: Enhanced Green Bin Program](#) authorizing staff to enter into a Shared Services Agreement with the Region for the multi-residential Green Bin program.

7.4 The Town of Whitby's Council is yet to authorize staff to enter into a Shared Service Agreement with the Region for the multi-residential Green Bin program.

8. Bylaw Update Required

8.1 Schedule P of By-Law #46-2011, A By-Law to Regulate the Provision of Waste Management Services Under the Jurisdiction of the Regional Municipality of Durham, needs amending to reflect the program changes outlined in this report and to require that future developments include provisions for the collection of organics in their plans as a condition for qualifying for municipal waste collection.

8.2 Given the various waste management designs used by developers based on the needs of existing or new buildings, Regional staff do not intend to require the use of any specific systems or layouts within buildings. However, Durham's waste management programs will continue to require participation in all waste diversion programs as a condition for properties to qualify for municipal waste collection services, and waste diversion must be as convenient as disposal.

9. Procurement

9.1 On September 25, 2023, the Region issued Request for Proposal (RFP) # P-1068-2023, for the collection of Multi-Residential Organics in the Region of Durham that closed on October 23, 2023. The successful bidder must provide all the staffing, vehicles and equipment necessary to collect multi-residential Green Bin materials at a minimum of once per week, to provide, own, and maintain in good working condition all bulk collection containers (wheeled tote containers and front-end bins), to assist the Region in coordinating with property owners and managers, and to assist the Region in promotion and education activities. The timing of # P-1068-2023 affords the contractor time to order the required collection vehicles as delivery can take up to two years. The contract will not be awarded until the Shared Services Agreement is signed by all parties.

9.2 RFP-1068-2023 was evaluated against the following criteria:

- a. Proposed Solution and Timelines (30%)
- b. Company Experience and Qualifications- Sample Projects (20%)
- c. Staff Experience and Qualifications (5%)
- d. Quality Management Plan (10%)
- e. Innovation (10%)
- f. Pricing (25%)

9.3 Miller Waste was the only bidder to meet the minimum 70 per cent scoring requirement and has undergone reference checks. The winning bid was for a total collection cost \$1,837,274. The Region will allocate the cost of this contract between the Region, Town of Whitby and City of Oshawa and will negotiate funding arrangements with the Town of Whitby and the City of Oshawa for their respective portion of the cost of the contract.

10. Proposed Program

10.1 Based on the results of the jurisdictional scan and the procurement process, the Regional program will include the following:

- a. One kitchen container per dwelling
- b. One information brochure per dwelling
- c. Signage for chute rooms, waste storage areas, and other areas, as needed
- d. Wheeled tote containers for centralized storage and collection
- e. Weekly collection at minimum, with twice-weekly collection for larger properties subject to needs assessment
- f. Acceptable materials same as curbside Green Bin program
- g. A material audit program to monitor program performance
- h. Program participation is a condition for qualifying for municipal waste collection services and must be as convenient as waste disposal.

10.2 The Region will provide an initial kitchen catcher container for residents to use in their units as well as all promotional material and signage to support the buildings. As outlined in Section 11, the Town of Whitby and the City of Oshawa will be responsible for their respective portion of these costs.

11. Financial Implications

- 11.1 Table Two provides the details on the total estimated annual cost of implementing the new expanded organics program in eligible multi-residential properties including the cost for the contracted collection services, contract administration, individual kitchen bins for each unit and education and promotion costs.
- 11.2 It should be noted that Table Two only includes the cost of collection and does not include the cost of processing which is estimated at \$436,000 annually which is offset by the elimination of the need to haul this material and to dispose of it at the Durham York Energy Centre for a combined savings of approximately \$220,000 annually.
- 11.3 In addition to the ongoing operating costs there are also one-time operating costs associated with the launch of the multi-residential expanded organics program which are itemized in Table 3.
- 11.4 The City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby are responsible for the collection of Green Bin materials in their respective municipalities. It is proposed that the Region will manage the contracted services and coordinate the program's implementation and delivery and bill back the respective cost of the program to the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby. Staff are currently negotiating an MOU with the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby which will outline the various roles and responsibilities of each of the partners in the MOU including framework by which the Region will bill the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby for their respective shares of the total costs. While the final cost shares will be defined through the MOU and cost allocations framework, Tables 2 and 3 outline an initial estimate of the costs for the Region, City of Oshawa and Town of Whitby for the multi-residential collection program.

Table 2: Estimated Annual Multi-Residential Green Bin Collection Program Costs

Estimated Annual Operating Costs *

Organics Program Task	Total	Region of Durham	City of Oshawa	Town of Whitby
Collection Contract	\$1,837,274	\$613,899	\$928,044	\$295,331
Ongoing Promotion and Kitchen Catchers	\$60,000	\$19,983	\$30,406	\$9,611
Total	\$1,897,274	\$633,882	\$958,450	\$304,942

Table 3: Estimated One-time Multi-Residential Green Bin Collection Program Costs

Estimated One-time Operating Costs *

Organics Program Task	Total	Region of Durham	City of Oshawa	Town of Whitby
In-house kitchen catcher containers & compostable bag samples	\$150,000	\$50,100	\$75,900	\$24,000
Promotion and Education Launch Campaign	\$130,000	\$43,420	\$65,780	\$20,800
Total	\$280,000	\$93,520	\$141,680	\$44,800

*Dollar amounts exclude applicable taxes.

- 11.5 Based on the costs outlined in Table 2, the estimated annual net cost to the Region of Durham (net of the recoveries from the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby) is \$633,882. It is estimated that these costs will impact the Region's 2025

Business Plans and Budget. The estimated net cost of the program to the Region represents an annual increase in the overall Regional property tax levy of 0.1 per cent. Given the challenges in quantifying and monitoring allocation of kitchen catchers and where promotion and education activities may span multiple programs, the Region may fund in practice the indirect costs of the collection system beyond the cost sharing allocation.

12. Relationship to Strategic Plan

12.1 This report aligns with/addresses the following strategic goals and priorities in the Durham Region Strategic Plan:

- a. Goal 1.1 Accelerate the adoption of green technologies and clean energy solutions through strategic partnerships and investment.
- b. Goal 1.2 Increase waste diversion and resource recovery.
- c. Goal 1.4 Demonstrate leadership in sustainability and addressing climate change.
- d. Goal 5.1 Optimize resources and partnerships to deliver exceptional quality services and value.
- e. Goal 5.2 Collaborate for a seamless service experience.

13. Conclusion

13.1 This report recommends that Regional Council approve a multi-residential Green Bin program for properties that qualify for municipal waste collection services and the amendment of Waste Management By-Law #46-2011 to reflect the program changes.

13.2 This program will help the Regional Municipality of Durham meet the regulatory requirements of Ontario's Food and Organic Waste Policy Statement and align with the Region's long-term organics management plan.

13.3 A Shared Services Agreement with the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby will outline the framework under which the Region will deliver this program to all approved multi-residential properties within the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby and recover the respective costs from the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby.

13.4 This report has been reviewed by the Chief Administrative Office - Legal Services Division and the Finance Department.

13.5 For additional information, contact: Andrew Evans, Director, Waste Management Services, at 905-668-7711, extension 4102.

14. Attachments

14.1 Attachment #1: Other Municipal Program Summary

Respectfully submitted,

Original signed by:

Ramesh Jagannathan, MBA, M.Eng., P.Eng., PTOE
Acting Commissioner of Works

Recommended for Presentation to Committee

**Original signed by Nancy Taylor
for**

Elaine C. Baxter-Trahair
Chief Administrative Officer

Summary of Other Municipal Organics Programs

There are several municipalities within Ontario that have already implemented a multi residential Source Separated Organics Program. Regional staff have spoken to representatives from each of these municipalities and reviewed their programs to learn from their experiences.

Barrie

The City of Barrie has a Multi-residential Source Separated Organics Program for properties with six or more units. Each unit is supplied with a kitchen bin to transfer to the building's large organic carts, which are also supplied by the City. Properties are required to participate in the program to receive the City's other waste collection services.

Halton Region

Halton Region has been in the process of implementing a Multi-residential Source Separated Organics Program since 2014. All multi-residential buildings must separate organic waste as per their Waste Management Bylaw, or they will not receive municipal waste collection services. The Region provides Green Carts (360 or 120 litres) as well as Kitchen Catchers for use in each dwelling units. The Region owns the carts and is responsible for replacing any broken or missing carts.

The Region has released the [ROP Guidelines - Development Design Guidelines for Source Separation of Solid Waste \(halton.ca\)](#) for developers of multi-residential properties which outlines how buildings must be designed to accommodate all waste streams. The Region allots one Green Cart for every 25 units and provides an initial free sample of bag liners and enzyme cart cleaner.

Hamilton

The City of Hamilton also has a Multi-residential Source Separated Organics Program. The City provides the option of a two cubic yard front-end collection bin or Green Carts for collection as well as a Kitchen Catcher for each individual unit. The City is responsible for replacing any broken or missing bins.

There are also [Design Requirements for New Developments](#) within the City. Buildings with more than 30 units are required to install three separate waste chutes, and smaller buildings require a waste room that has an appropriately sized storage area as per their detailed standards.

Niagara Region

The Niagara Region has a Multi-residential Source Separated Organics Program for properties with seven or more units if they purchase a 160-litre cart. The property manager is responsible for maintaining and replacing the carts. The Region provides [Large Apartment Info](#) for developers and property managers.

Ottawa

The City of Ottawa has a Multi-residential Source Separated Organics Program for properties with six or more units. The City provides properties with 47 litre, 80 litre or 240 litre bins as well as an in-unit bin for each unit. The containers are owned by the contractors, and they are responsible for maintaining and replacing any broken or missing bins.

The City has released the [Ottawa Development Standards](#) which outlines how buildings must be designed to accommodate all waste streams for property managers and developers.

While speaking with representatives from the City, it was learned that one of the major challenges that they are facing is space. Many buildings were designed before current design standards. To address this, Ottawa offers various bin sizes and more frequent collection to certain buildings. They suggested providing more outreach and education to each of the properties to reduce contamination.

Richmond Hill

The City of Richmond Hill has a Multi-residential Source Separated Organics Program for properties as outlined in their [Development Standards](#). At the time of implementation, pre-existing multi-residential buildings were able to opt into the program, however all new developments are required to participate. The City provides an in-unit bin and a 240 litre cart to the buildings at a rate of one cart for every 25 units. All new developments more than five storeys are required to install a three-chute waste sorting system.

Simcoe County

Simcoe County has a Multi-residential Source Separated Organics Program for properties with more than six units that operates on a case-by-case basis. 120 litre carts can be purchased from the County and are maintained by the property manager. The County has released [Development Requirements](#), however, it does not provide instructions regarding the organics program for multi-residential properties.

Toronto

The City of Toronto has had a Multi-residential Source Separated Organics Program since 2009. All multi-residential buildings must separate organic waste as per their Waste Management Bylaw, or they will not receive service. The City initially provides 35-gallon curbside totes for buildings with less than 30 units, and front-end bins for buildings with more than 30 units but replacing damaged or missing bins is the responsibility of the property manager. The City provides kitchen catchers for each multi-residential unit. The City has released [Development Requirements](#) for developers and property managers, which outlines the options for curbside collection for buildings with 9-30 residential units, and front-end collection for buildings with 31 or more.

Representatives from the City noted that they are facing major challenges with contamination and participation with larger buildings, and that they work with their by-law officers for support. They have recommended clear education and communication, hands-on outreach, consistent follow-up, and multi-language promotional and educational materials for a successful program.

Vaughan

The City of Vaughan has a Multi-residential Source Separated Organics Program, which all multi-residential buildings are required to participate in as per Vaughan's bylaw 135-2017. The City initially provides front-end bins or carts (32-95 gallons) to each property, and property managers are required to purchase any replacements going forward. The City has released [Waste Collection Design Standards](#) for property managers and developers, and outlines the requirements of a three stream waste system.

Representatives from the City have noted that there has been good participation in the program thus far, but they are having some issues with contamination in buildings with tri-sorters and are encouraging three separate chute systems going forward. Initial challenges faced during the implementation process included space constraints and concerns about odours and pests. For a successful program, Vaughan recommends better education for property managers, residents, and board members.

Multi-Residential Organics Collection Program - Estimated Cost Comparison

Program Roll-Out (one time cost)	Option A: Region	Option B: City	Option C: Status quo
Fleet Asset Purchase (One time capital cost for fleet purchase)	Included	\$500,000	N/A
Initial In-unit kitchen bins and compostable bags	\$75,900.00	\$75,900	
P&E Campaign	\$66,780.00	\$66,780	
External Tote/Bin Purchase	Included	\$80,000	
Distribution/Working with Property Managers	Included	Costs covered under staffing resources.	
TOTAL	\$142,680.00	\$722,680	

Annual Operating Costs	Option A: Region	Option B: City	Option C: Status quo
Collection Contract	\$928,044.00	n/a	N/A
Fleet Operating (includes capital replacement of fleet asset, gas, maintenance and repairs)	Included	\$170,000	
Ongoing Promotion, in-unit Kitchen containers, Tote Replacement/Distribution	\$30,406.00	\$30,406	
Salaries and Benefits	Included in contract cost	\$277,000	
Total Annual Operating Cost	\$958,450.00	\$477,406	
7-yr Total*	\$6,709,150.00	\$3,341,842	

* Region's Collection contract term is 7 years and includes supply of totes and tote washing, labeling, replacement/maintenance and liaising with property managers/owners.