

INFO-24-03



Sent Via Email

December 20, 2023

Celeste Dugas
District Manager
York-Durham District Office
230 Westney Road South, 5th Floor
Ajax, ON L1S 7J5

**The Regional
Municipality of
Durham**

Corporate Services
Department –
Legislative Services
Division

Dear: C. Dugas

**RE: Organics Management Plan – Multi-Residential Enhanced
Green Bin Program (2023-WR-9) File: E08**

605 Rossland Rd. E.
Level 1
PO Box 623
Whitby, ON L1N 6A3
Canada

905-668-7711
1-800-372-1102

durham.ca

**Alexander Harras
M.P.A.
Director of
Legislative Services
& Regional Clerk**

Council of the Region of Durham, at its meeting held on December 20, 2023, adopted the following recommendations of the Works Committee:

- “A) That staff be authorized to implement a Multi-Residential Green Bin Collection Program for multi-residential buildings already receiving Regional waste collection services;
- B) That the Commissioner of Works be authorized to enter into a Shared Services Agreement with the Town of Whitby and the City of Oshawa outlining the framework under which the Regional Municipality of Durham may operate a region-wide Multi-Residential Green Bin Collection Program, including within the Town of Whitby and the City of Oshawa, subject to the satisfaction of the Commissioner of Finance and the Regional Solicitor;
- C) That the Commissioner of Works be authorized to amend By-Law #46-2011, a By-Law to Regulate the Provision of Waste Management Services Under the Jurisdiction of the Regional Municipality of Durham to reflect the necessary program changes;
- D) That the estimated annual gross program cost of \$1.9 million (\$0.95 million in 2025), with costs of approximately 50.6 per cent and 16.0 per cent based on the number of units, be recovered from the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby respectively;

- E) That the net cost to the Region be included in the 2025 and future Waste Management Business Plans and Budgets; and
- F) That a copy of Report #2023-WR-9 of the Acting Commissioner of Works be distributed to the local area municipalities and the Ontario Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks York-Durham District Office for information.”

Please find enclosed a copy of Report #2023-WR-9 for your information.

Alexander Harras

Alexander Harras,
Director of Legislative Services & Regional Clerk

AH/sc

Enclosed

- c: N. Cooper, Clerk, Town of Ajax
- F. Lamanna, Clerk, Township of Brock
- J. Gallagher, Clerk, Municipality of Clarington
- M. Medeiros, Clerk, City of Oshawa
- S. Cassel, Clerk, City of Pickering
- R. Walton, Acting Clerk, Township of Scugog
- D. Leroux, Clerk, Township of Uxbridge
- C. Harris, Clerk, Town of Whitby
- R. Jagannathan, Acting Commissioner of Works

If this information is required in an accessible format, please contact 1-800-372-1102 ext. 3540.



The Regional Municipality of Durham Report

To: Works Committee
From: Acting Commissioner of Works
Report: #2023-WR-9
Date: December 6, 2023

Subject:

Organics Management Plan – Multi-Residential Enhanced Green Bin Program

Recommendation:

That the Works Committee recommends to Regional Council:

- A) That staff be authorized to implement a Multi-Residential Green Bin Collection Program for multi-residential buildings already receiving regional waste collection services;
- B) That the Commissioner of Works be authorized to enter into a Shared Services Agreement with the Town of Whitby and the City of Oshawa outlining the framework under which the Regional Municipality of Durham may operate a region-wide Multi-Residential Green Bin Collection Program, including within the Town of Whitby and the City of Oshawa, subject to the satisfaction of the Commissioner of Finance and the Regional Solicitor;
- C) That the Commissioner of Works be authorized to amend By-Law #46-2011, a By-Law to Regulate the Provision of Waste Management Services Under the Jurisdiction of the Regional Municipality of Durham to reflect the necessary program changes;
- D) That the estimated annual gross program cost of \$1.9 million (\$0.95 million in 2025), with costs of approximately 50.6 per cent and 16.0 per cent based on the number of units, be recovered from the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby respectively.

- E) That the net cost to the Region be included in the 2025 and future Waste Management Business Plans and Budgets; and
 - F) That a copy of this report be distributed to Local Area Municipalities and the Ontario Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks York-Durham District Office for information.
-

Report:**1. Purpose**

- 1.1 The purpose of this report is to seek Regional Council's approval to implement a multi-residential source-separated organics collection program and associated measures to ensure the success of the program.

2. Background

- 2.1 On March 1, 2023, Regional Council approved Report [#2023-WR-3](#), which outlined the next steps for the development of a Green Bin program for multi-residential buildings already receiving municipal waste collection services.
- 2.2 Currently, the Region provides recycling and garbage collection to 419 multi-residential properties (26,262 dwelling units), as noted in Table 1 below. Multi-residential buildings that do not meet the Region's requirements manage their waste with private contracts.
- 2.3 The Region does not have a multi-residential Green Bin program. The multi-residential sector is the fastest growing housing sector in the Region, and multi-residential organics, which account for approximately 44 per cent of the garbage collected from multi-residential properties, represent the best opportunity for the Region for additional waste diversion beyond expanding the curbside Green Bin program.

Table 1: Multi-residential properties serviced by the Region (September 2023)

Municipality	# of Multi-residential Properties Serviced	# of Individual Units Serviced
Oshawa	221	13,309
Whitby	76	4,207
Pickering	36	3,661
Ajax	34	3,124
Clarington	27	1,067
Uxbridge	15	511
Scugog	4	138
Brock	6	245
TOTAL	419	26,262

- 2.4 As each building is unique, the proposed multi-residential green bin program will require a multi-year implementation to allow for the changes needed to accommodate the program in each building. This is especially true for buildings with limited storage capacity. No building retrofits are anticipated, and required changes will be related to individual property management practices.
- 2.5 New multi-residential projects currently in the development review process will be informed of the upcoming changes with a request for appropriate site accommodations. Organics management will be included in the Region's future multi-residential development review process.
- 2.6 The Region processes all curbside green bins collected in Durham, except in, the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby, which collect the curbside Green Bin materials in their respective municipalities. The Region will collect organics from multi-residential properties in the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby under a shared services agreement for the proposed multi-residential Green Bin program. The agreement will outline the provisions under which the Region will recover

from the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby their respective share of the program's total costs.

3. Previous Reports and Decisions

- 3.1 In June 2019, Regional Council approved Report [#2019-COW-17](#), which outlined the 'Organics Management Next Steps and Updated Preliminary Business Case' to adopt wet AD as the preferred technology for the Region's long-term organics management plan to maximize diversion, including Green Bin organics and the organic fraction of mixed garbage wastes.
- 3.2 In June 2022, Regional Council approved Report [#2022-COW-22](#), authorizing staff to cancel the Region's Mixed Waste Pre-sort and Anaerobic Digestion Facility ("AD Project") procurement process in accordance with the requirements of the Negotiated Request for Proposal, NRFP 1080-2021 ("NRFP").
- 3.3 In March 2023, Regional Council approved Report [#2023-WR-3](#), authorizing staff to launch a Region-wide Enhanced Green Bin program to expand the list of acceptable items in the current program. Regional Council also granted approval to develop a Green Bin program for multi-residential properties receiving regional waste collection services and make respective amendments to By-Law [#46-2011](#).

4. Ontario Food and Organic Waste Policy Statement

- 4.1 Ontario's Food and Organic Waste Policy Statement (Policy Statement) requires municipalities to achieve:
 - a. 70 per cent waste reduction and resource recovery of food and organic waste generated by single-family dwellings in urban settlement areas by 2023; and
 - b. 50 per cent waste reduction and resource recovery of food and organic waste generated at multi-residential properties by 2025.
- 4.2 It also encourages the diversion of the following materials through organics separation programs:
 - a. Personal hygiene waste,
 - b. Sanitary products,
 - c. Shredded paper (already accepted in the Region's program)
 - d. Additional paper products (already accepted in the Region's program),

- e. Compostable products and packaging,
 - f. Pet food (already accepted in the Region's green bin) and;
 - g. Pet waste.
- 4.3 In 2021, the Region diverted 43 percent of the available organics, including leaf and yard waste materials into the single-family home waste stream. A multi-residential Green Bin program will improve this performance and help the Region achieve compliance with Ontario's Food and Organic Waste Policy Statement.

5. Existing Approved Multi-Residential Building Inspections

- 5.1 Regional staff inspected the 419 approved multi-residential properties to assess the level of effort required to implement the proposed multi-residential Green Bin Collection Program. Based on these inspections, each property was classified into three categories of readiness to receive the program as follows:
- a. Ready to implement - The property has adequate space, infrastructure, and staff to manage organic waste and has clear guidelines and incentives for residents to participate in the program and reduce contamination. The property can start the program with minimal changes to its processes.
 - b. Minor changes required - The property may need to make some adjustments or improvements to optimize the process, may also need to update its guidelines and incentives for residents and would benefit from more education and outreach. The property can start the program with moderate changes to its processes.
 - c. Significant site challenges - The property has limited or no space, infrastructure, or staff to deal with organic waste. The property may face physical, logistical, or financial barriers to implement the program, may also have low awareness or engagement from residents, and may see resistance from property management. The property owner would require significant changes to its processes to start the program.
- 5.2 Property managers and owners were given an opportunity to provide their insights for implementing the proposed multi-residential Green Bin program.
- 5.3 The inspections confirm that 64 percent of buildings are ready to implement a multi-residential green bin program, 32 per cent can implement with minor changes, and 4 per cent may face significant site challenges. This information will inform the phased-in implementation plan. Any costs associated with ensuring that properties can accommodate the program will be the responsibility of the property owner.

6. Other Municipal Multi-Residential Green Bin Programs

- 6.1 Halton Region, the City of Hamilton, the City of Ottawa, and the City of Toronto have implemented multi-residential Green Bin programs. Regional staff spoke with representatives from these municipalities to learn from their experiences. The findings are outlined in Attachment #1.
- 6.2 These municipalities have design standards to facilitate the separation of organic waste, including tri-sorters, bi-sorters, three-chute systems, and waste storage facilities. They also offer options for collecting organic waste, such as, wheeled tote containers ranging in size from 121 – 360 litres (32-95 gallons) and 1.8 cubic metres (2-yard) front-end bins. The number and size of bins allocated per building depend on the number of units in each building.
- 6.3 Staff have solicited proposals for the design and delivery of a multi-residential Green Bin collection program from the industry. The proposals received include similar features as those described above, including providing kitchen catcher containers and respective information/instructions to residents, using wheeled tote containers for centralized collection and weekly collection at a minimum, with a twice-weekly collection schedule for larger properties.
- 6.4 The most common lesson learned from all municipalities is that program success depends on maintaining a comprehensive education and compliance campaign to ensure effective program participation. An annual promotional budget between \$2.28 and \$6.50 per dwelling unit is recommended for ongoing program success. Appropriate costs will be Regional with cost recovery from Whitby and Oshawa through the recommended Shared Services Agreement.

7. Shared Services Agreement with the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby

- 7.1 Regional staff are jointly developing a Shared Services Agreement with the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby, which will outline the provisions under which the Region will deliver a multi-residential Green Bin program in the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby and basis by which the Region will allocate and recover the costs of the program from the Town of Whitby and the City of Oshawa.
- 7.2 The intent of the shared services agreement is to recognize program efficiencies and cost benefits through administration of a single consistent program across the Region under a single contract. The program will also be able to leverage

consistent common messaging to residents and bring the communities into alignment with Ontario's Food and Organic Waste Policy Statement.

7.3 The City of Oshawa Council has approved Report CO-23-34 authorizing staff to enter into a Shared Services Agreement with the Region for the multi-residential Green Bin program.

7.4 The Town of Whitby's Council is yet to authorize staff to enter into a Shared Service Agreement with the Region for the multi-residential Green Bin program.

8. Bylaw Update Required

8.1 Schedule P of By-Law #46-2011, A By-Law to Regulate the Provision of Waste Management Services Under the Jurisdiction of the Regional Municipality of Durham, needs amending to reflect the program changes outlined in this report and to require that future developments include provisions for the collection of organics in their plans as a condition for qualifying for municipal waste collection.

8.2 Given the various waste management designs used by developers based on the needs of existing or new buildings, Regional staff do not intend to require the use of any specific systems or layouts within buildings. However, Durham's waste management programs will continue to require participation in all waste diversion programs as a condition for properties to qualify for municipal waste collection services, and waste diversion must be as convenient as disposal.

9. Procurement

9.1 On September 25, 2023, the Region issued Request for Proposal (RFP) # P-1068-2023, for the collection of Multi-Residential Organics in the Region of Durham that closed on October 23, 2023. The successful bidder must provide all the staffing, vehicles and equipment necessary to collect multi-residential Green Bin materials at a minimum of once per week, to provide, own, and maintain in good working condition all bulk collection containers (wheeled tote containers and front-end bins), to assist the Region in coordinating with property owners and managers, and to assist the Region in promotion and education activities. The timing of # P-1068-2023 affords the contractor time to order the required collection vehicles as delivery can take up to two years. The contract will not be awarded until the Shared Services Agreement is signed by all parties.

9.2 RFP-1068-2023 was evaluated against the following criteria:

- a. Proposed Solution and Timelines (30%)
- b. Company Experience and Qualifications- Sample Projects (20%)
- c. Staff Experience and Qualifications (5%)
- d. Quality Management Plan (10%)
- e. Innovation (10%)
- f. Pricing (25%)

9.3 Miller Waste was the only bidder to meet the minimum 70 per cent scoring requirement and has undergone reference checks. The winning bid was for a total collection cost \$1,837,274. The Region will allocate the cost of this contract between the Region, Town of Whitby and City of Oshawa and will negotiate funding arrangements with the Town of Whitby and the City of Oshawa for their respective portion of the cost of the contract.

10. Proposed Program

10.1 Based on the results of the jurisdictional scan and the procurement process, the Regional program will include the following:

- a. One kitchen container per dwelling
- b. One information brochure per dwelling
- c. Signage for chute rooms, waste storage areas, and other areas, as needed
- d. Wheeled tote containers for centralized storage and collection
- e. Weekly collection at minimum, with twice-weekly collection for larger properties subject to needs assessment
- f. Acceptable materials same as curbside Green Bin program
- g. A material audit program to monitor program performance
- h. Program participation is a condition for qualifying for municipal waste collection services and must be as convenient as waste disposal.

10.2 The Region will provide an initial kitchen catcher container for residents to use in their units as well as all promotional material and signage to support the buildings. As outlined in Section 11, the Town of Whitby and the City of Oshawa will be responsible for their respective portion of these costs.

11. Financial Implications

- 11.1 Table Two provides the details on the total estimated annual cost of implementing the new expanded organics program in eligible multi-residential properties including the cost for the contracted collection services, contract administration, individual kitchen bins for each unit and education and promotion costs.
- 11.2 It should be noted that Table Two only includes the cost of collection and does not include the cost of processing which is estimated at \$436,000 annually which is offset by the elimination of the need to haul this material and to dispose of it at the Durham York Energy Centre for a combined savings of approximately \$220,000 annually.
- 11.3 In addition to the ongoing operating costs there are also one-time operating costs associated with the launch of the multi-residential expanded organics program which are itemized in Table 3.
- 11.4 The City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby are responsible for the collection of Green Bin materials in their respective municipalities. It is proposed that the Region will manage the contracted services and coordinate the program's implementation and delivery and bill back the respective cost of the program to the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby. Staff are currently negotiating an MOU with the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby which will outline the various roles and responsibilities of each of the partners in the MOU including framework by which the Region will bill the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby for their respective shares of the total costs. While the final cost shares will be defined through the MOU and cost allocations framework, Tables 2 and 3 outline an initial estimate of the costs for the Region, City of Oshawa and Town of Whitby for the multi-residential collection program.

Table 2: Estimated Annual Multi-Residential Green Bin Collection Program Costs

Estimated Annual Operating Costs *

Organics Program Task	Total	Region of Durham	City of Oshawa	Town of Whitby
Collection Contract	\$1,837,274	\$613,899	\$928,044	\$295,331
Ongoing Promotion and Kitchen Catchers	\$60,000	\$19,983	\$30,406	\$9,611
Total	\$1,897,274	\$633,882	\$958,450	\$304,942

Table 3: Estimated One-time Multi-Residential Green Bin Collection Program Costs

Estimated One-time Operating Costs *

Organics Program Task	Total	Region of Durham	City of Oshawa	Town of Whitby
In-house kitchen catcher containers & compostable bag samples	\$150,000	\$50,100	\$75,900	\$24,000
Promotion and Education Launch Campaign	\$130,000	\$43,420	\$65,780	\$20,800
Total	\$280,000	\$93,520	\$141,680	\$44,800

*Dollar amounts exclude applicable taxes.

- 11.5 Based on the costs outlined in Table 2, the estimated annual net cost to the Region of Durham (net of the recoveries from the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby) is \$633,882. It is estimated that these costs will impact the Region's 2025

Business Plans and Budget. The estimated net cost of the program to the Region represents an annual increase in the overall Regional property tax levy of 0.1 per cent. Given the challenges in quantifying and monitoring allocation of kitchen catchers and where promotion and education activities may span multiple programs, the Region may fund in practice the indirect costs of the collection system beyond the cost sharing allocation.

12. Relationship to Strategic Plan

- 12.1 This report aligns with/addresses the following strategic goals and priorities in the Durham Region Strategic Plan:
- a. Goal 1.1 Accelerate the adoption of green technologies and clean energy solutions through strategic partnerships and investment.
 - b. Goal 1.2 Increase waste diversion and resource recovery.
 - c. Goal 1.4 Demonstrate leadership in sustainability and addressing climate change.
 - d. Goal 5.1 Optimize resources and partnerships to deliver exceptional quality services and value.
 - e. Goal 5.2 Collaborate for a seamless service experience.

13. Conclusion

- 13.1 This report recommends that Regional Council approve a multi-residential Green Bin program for properties that qualify for municipal waste collection services and the amendment of Waste Management By-Law #46-2011 to reflect the program changes.
- 13.2 This program will help the Regional Municipality of Durham meet the regulatory requirements of Ontario's Food and Organic Waste Policy Statement and align with the Region's long-term organics management plan.
- 13.3 A Shared Services Agreement with the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby will outline the framework under which the Region will deliver this program to all approved multi-residential properties within the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby and recover the respective costs from the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby.
- 13.4 This report has been reviewed by the Chief Administrative Office - Legal Services Division and the Finance Department.

13.5 For additional information, contact: Andrew Evans, Director, Waste Management Services, at 905-668-7711, extension 4102.

14. Attachments

14.1 Attachment #1: Other Municipal Program Summary

Respectfully submitted,

Original signed by:

Ramesh Jagannathan, MBA, M.Eng., P.Eng., PTOE
Acting Commissioner of Works

Recommended for Presentation to Committee

**Original signed by Nancy Taylor
for**

Elaine C. Baxter-Trahair
Chief Administrative Officer

Summary of Other Municipal Organics Programs

There are several municipalities within Ontario that have already implemented a multi residential Source Separated Organics Program. Regional staff have spoken to representatives from each of these municipalities and reviewed their programs to learn from their experiences.

Barrie

The City of Barrie has a Multi-residential Source Separated Organics Program for properties with six or more units. Each unit is supplied with a kitchen bin to transfer to the building's large organic carts, which are also supplied by the City. Properties are required to participate in the program to receive the City's other waste collection services.

Halton Region

Halton Region has been in the process of implementing a Multi-residential Source Separated Organics Program since 2014. All multi-residential buildings must separate organic waste as per their Waste Management Bylaw, or they will not receive municipal waste collection services. The Region provides Green Carts (360 or 120 litres) as well as Kitchen Catchers for use in each dwelling units. The Region owns the carts and is responsible for replacing any broken or missing carts.

The Region has released the [ROP Guidelines - Development Design Guidelines for Source Separation of Solid Waste \(halton.ca\)](#) for developers of multi-residential properties which outlines how buildings must be designed to accommodate all waste streams. The Region allots one Green Cart for every 25 units and provides an initial free sample of bag liners and enzyme cart cleaner.

Hamilton

The City of Hamilton also has a Multi-residential Source Separated Organics Program. The City provides the option of a two cubic yard front-end collection bin or Green Carts for collection as well as a Kitchen Catcher for each individual unit. The City is responsible for replacing any broken or missing bins.

There are also [Design Requirements for New Developments](#) within the City. Buildings with more than 30 units are required to install three separate waste chutes, and smaller buildings require a waste room that has an appropriately sized storage area as per their detailed standards.

Niagara Region

The Niagara Region has a Multi-residential Source Separated Organics Program for properties with seven or more units if they purchase a 160-litre cart. The property manager is responsible for maintaining and replacing the carts. The Region provides [Large Apartment Info](#) for developers and property managers.

Ottawa

The City of Ottawa has a Multi-residential Source Separated Organics Program for properties with six or more units. The City provides properties with 47 litre, 80 litre or 240 litre bins as well as an in-unit bin for each unit. The containers are owned by the contractors, and they are responsible for maintaining and replacing any broken or missing bins.

The City has released the [Ottawa Development Standards](#) which outlines how buildings must be designed to accommodate all waste streams for property managers and developers.

While speaking with representatives from the City, it was learned that one of the major challenges that they are facing is space. Many buildings were designed before current design standards. To address this, Ottawa offers various bin sizes and more frequent collection to certain buildings. They suggested providing more outreach and education to each of the properties to reduce contamination.

Richmond Hill

The City of Richmond Hill has a Multi-residential Source Separated Organics Program for properties as outlined in their [Development Standards](#). At the time of implementation, pre-existing multi-residential buildings were able to opt into the program, however all new developments are required to participate. The City provides an in-unit bin and a 240 litre cart to the buildings at a rate of one cart for every 25 units. All new developments more than five storeys are required to install a three-chute waste sorting system.

Simcoe County

Simcoe County has a Multi-residential Source Separated Organics Program for properties with more than six units that operates on a case-by-case basis. 120 litre carts can be purchased from the County and are maintained by the property manager. The County has released [Development Requirements](#), however, it does not provide instructions regarding the organics program for multi-residential properties.

Toronto

The City of Toronto has had a Multi-residential Source Separated Organics Program since 2009. All multi-residential buildings must separate organic waste as per their Waste Management Bylaw, or they will not receive service. The City initially provides 35-gallon curbside totes for buildings with less than 30 units, and front-end bins for buildings with more than 30 units but replacing damaged or missing bins is the responsibility of the property manager. The City provides kitchen catchers for each multi-residential unit. The City has released [Development Requirements](#) for developers and property managers, which outlines the options for curbside collection for buildings with 9-30 residential units, and front-end collection for buildings with 31 or more.

Representatives from the City noted that they are facing major challenges with contamination and participation with larger buildings, and that they work with their by-law officers for support. They have recommended clear education and communication, hands-on outreach, consistent follow-up, and multi-language promotional and educational materials for a successful program.

Vaughan

The City of Vaughan has a Multi-residential Source Separated Organics Program, which all multi-residential buildings are required to participate in as per Vaughan's bylaw 135-2017. The City initially provides front-end bins or carts (32-95 gallons) to each property, and property managers are required to purchase any replacements going forward. The City has released [Waste Collection Design Standards](#) for property managers and developers, and outlines the requirements of a three stream waste system.

Representatives from the City have noted that there has been good participation in the program thus far, but they are having some issues with contamination in buildings with tri-sorters and are encouraging three separate chute systems going forward. Initial challenges faced during the implementation process included space constraints and concerns about odours and pests. For a successful program, Vaughan recommends better education for property managers, residents, and board members.

To: Community and Operations Services Committee

From: Ron Diskey, Commissioner,
Community and Operations Services Department

Report Number: CO-23-34

Date of Report: June 7, 2023

Date of Meeting: June 12, 2023

Subject: Enhanced Green Bin Program

Ward: All Wards

File: 03-05

1.0 Purpose

The purpose of this report is to:

1. Provide information on the Region of Durham's proposed changes to the green bin program and expansion of the program to multi-residential properties; and,
2. Seek approval to amend the City's Waste Collection By-law to align with the Region's expanded program requirements.

2.0 Recommendation

That the Community and Operations Services Committee recommend to City Council:

1. That staff be authorized to work with the Region of Durham's Waste Management Division on the coordination of the enhanced green bin program; and,
2. That staff review of the roles and responsibilities as it relates to the provision of waste collection services including green bin collection at multi-residential buildings; and,
3. That staff report back on the outcome of the discussions with the Region; and,
4. That the City's Waste Collection By-law 11-2008, as amended, be further amended to reflect the organics management program changes pending further discussions with the Region of Durham.

3.0 Executive Summary

N/A

4.0 Input From Other Sources

- Town of Whitby
- Region of Durham
- Legal Services
- Municipal Law Enforcement and Licensing
- Finance Services

5.0 Analysis

5.1 Background

The City of Oshawa is responsible for providing residential curbside collection of garbage and organics including green bins and yard waste and front-end collection services (combined collection using large bins) of approved medium to high density multi-residential buildings in Oshawa. Due to specialized equipment and collection requirements the City contracts the front-end collection to a private service provider. Once the materials are collected the City transfers the responsibility for managing the processing or disposal of the material to the Region of Durham (“Region”).

The Region provides similar collection services in the 6 lower-tier municipalities within their purview (City of Pickering, Town of Ajax, Municipality of Clarington, and the Townships of Brock, Scugog and Uxbridge) through their own collection contracts. Currently, the Region is also responsible for collecting and processing blue box recycling from both curbside households and approved multi-residential buildings across the Region including within the City of Oshawa.

There have not been significant changes to the green bin program since its implementation in 2006. However, recent changes to policy at the provincial level, including the Province of Ontario’s Food and Organic Waste Policy Statement issued April 30, 2018 (“Food and Organic Waste Policy Statement”), requires municipalities to reduce food and organic waste generated by both single-family dwellings (70% by 2023) and multi-residential dwellings (50% by 2025). To achieve these targets the Province is encouraging the diversion of a number of items previously not acceptable in the Region’s green bin organics collection program including:

- Personal hygiene wastes;
- Sanitary products;
- Compostable packaging and products; and,
- Pet wastes.

To meet this Food and Organic Waste Policy Statement and to achieve the targets set out in the Region’s approved [2022-2040 Long-term Waste Management Plan](#), the Region will be moving forward on implementing the following changes to the current source separated

organics collection program within the 6 municipalities they have collection jurisdiction over. These changes will include:

- expanding the list of acceptable materials allowed in the green bin to include diapers, personal sanitary products, adult incontinence products, pet waste, pet litter, and any other material the Region deems processible; and,
- expanding the green bin program, in principle, to include multi-residential households.

At its meeting held on March 1, 2023, pursuant to Report #2023-WR-3 appended as Attachment 1, Regional Council adopted the following recommendations:

- “A) That Regional Council approve the following requirements to implement the proposed organics management program:
- i) Launch an Enhanced Green Bin that adds diapers, personal sanitary products, adult incontinence products, pet waste, pet litter, and any other material deemed processible by the Regional Municipality of Durham to the list of acceptable materials in the Regional Municipality of Durham’s Green Bin program; and
 - iii) To accommodate the requirements of the Food and Organic Waste Policy Statement, Regional Council approve, in principle, the development of a Green Bin program for multi-residential buildings receiving Regional waste collection services.
- B) That Regional Council direct staff to amend By-Law #46-2011, A By-Law to Regulate the Provision of Waste Management Services Under the Jurisdiction of the Regional Municipality of Durham, effective July 1, 2024 to reflect the above program changes; and
- C) That a copy of this report be distributed to Local Area Municipalities and the Ontario Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks York-Durham District Office for their information.”

Regional Report #2023-WR-3, provided as Attachment 1, provides further details and information on the Region’s next steps. Please note that the recommendation to reduce the garbage bag limit was defeated at Regional Council but this could be something the City of Oshawa may choose to advance on its own if desired.

5.2 Curbside Enhanced Green Bin Program

Staff are supportive of expanding the existing green bin program to include personal hygiene wastes, sanitary products, compostable packaging and products, and pet wastes. The addition of these items to the green bin program will result in service level improvements for many residents as these odorous items will move from being collected bi-weekly in the garbage to weekly in the green bin.

Staff are working with the Region to implement a coordinated approach and are currently assessing operational impacts that may arise from this change including equipment/resource needs and the potential for a larger bins needed to accommodate the new material. Depending on the outcome of discussions there may be moderate impacts on the City's current collection service as we accommodate the additional material in the green bins. The change in Oshawa may be phased in after the Region commences services in the 6 lower-tier municipalities under its collection jurisdiction.

5.3 Multi-residential Organics Program

The City contracts the collection of garbage from multi-residential buildings (greater than 8 units) to a contractor that has the equipment and resources to collect front-end garbage bins. The expansion of a source separated organics collection program to multi-residential buildings is outside the scope of the City's current waste collection contract and would require significant resources for the City to implement on its own.

Staff have been meeting with staff from the Region's Waste Management Division to review the implementation of the multi-residential organics collection program in Oshawa and the opportunity to enter into a shared service agreement with the Region. The shared service agreement would provide the roles and responsibilities for the Region to roll-out and operate a multi-residential organics collection program in Oshawa similar to the recycling collection program undertaken by the Region. A shared services agreement will be executed in a form approved by the City Solicitor in accordance with Item 46 of the City's Delegation By-law 29-2009, as amended.

As part of this review, staff are looking at the potential option of transitioning the multi-residential garbage collection program, currently undertaken through contracted services, to the Region to be included as part of their multi-residential collection program. There are efficiencies with respect to site plan review and contract administration that could be achieved by combining organics and garbage collection under one contractor. Staff will report back in the future under a separate report.

5.4 Waste Collection By-law changes

Based on the changes to the green bin program, the City's Waste Collection By-law 113-2008, as amended, will require amendments. The following amendments are proposed to ensure consistency with curbside collection and the Region's program. Amendments related to the addition of green bin collection at multi-residential properties will also be considered pending discussions with the Region and the outcome of the Service Agreement.

Section	Current	Proposed Amendment
Definitions 2.1 (p)	“Green Bin” means the designated receptacle supplied or approved by the Region for setting out source-separated household kitchen food wastes for collection.	“Green Bin” means a receptacle, approved and supplied by the Region or the City, for setting out Organic Materials.
Definitions 2.1 (q)	“Green Bin Program” means a program for the curbside collection of source separated household kitchen food wastes from residential sources using a designated receptacle supplied or approved by the Region.	“Green Bin Program” means a program for the collection of Organic Material from residential sources using an approved Green Bin.
Definitions 2.1 (aa)	“Organic Materials” means household kitchen food waste and other compostable household materials which are acceptable for collection in the Green Bin Program.	“Organic Materials” means household organic waste such as food waste, plate scrapings, dairy products, paper fibers and other organic material such as pet waste, personal hygiene and sanitary products deemed acceptable by the Region and collected separately for the purpose of composting as identified.
Green Bin 10.16	No Person shall Set Out or cause or permit the Setting Out of Organic Material other than within a Biodegradable Compostable Bag placed within a Green Bin.	To be modified as appropriate pending further discussions with the Region.
Green Bin 10.17	No Person shall Set Out or cause or permit the Setting Out of a Green Bin weighing in excess of 20 kilograms (44 pounds).	To be modified as appropriate pending further discussions with the Region on the type of Green Bin to be used.

Section 11 Waste Collection – Multi-Residential Complex	Sections providing information on approval of service and set out locations for multi-residential properties.	To be modified as appropriate pending further discussions with the Region on roles and responsibilities.
---	---	--

6.0 Financial Implications

There are no financial implications resulting from this report at this time. As the provision of green bin collection to multi-residential buildings is a “new” service there would be no increase in the City’s portion of the tax bill and any transition of existing contracted services to the Region could result in a decrease to the City’s portion. Staff will continue to assess the implications that the increase in green bin materials will have on the City’s curbside collection operation, any financial implications will be reported on during the annual budget process including potential capital costs associated with fleet changes.

Pending further discussions with the Region, Staff will report back on any financial implications and possible efficiencies that could be achieved if the Region was to assume the City’s front-end garbage collection contract for multi-residential buildings in Oshawa.

7.0 Relationship to the Oshawa Strategic Plan

This report addresses the Oshawa Strategic Plan by responding to the goal “Economic Prosperity & Financial Stewardship” under the theme of “Responsible Taxation” by ensuring quality core programs and services that are responsive to community needs; the goal of “Responsible Leadership” through embracing innovation in the provision of programs and services and improving intergovernmental relations; and, the goal of “Environmental Responsibility” under the theme “Less Waste Generation” by diverting organics from disposal.



Mike Saulnier, Director,
Operations Services



Ron Diskey, Commissioner,
Community and Operations Services Department

If this information is required in an accessible format, please contact 1-800-372-1102 ext. 3540.



The Regional Municipality of Durham Report

To: Works Committee
 From: Commissioner of Works
 Report: #2023-WR-3
 Date: February 8, 2023

Subject:

Organics Management Plan – Next Steps

Recommendation:

That the Works Committee recommends to Regional Council:

- A) That Regional Council approve the following requirements to implement the proposed organics management program:
- i) Launch an Enhanced Green Bin that adds diapers, personal sanitary products, adult incontinence products, pet waste, pet litter, and any other material deemed processible by the Regional Municipality of Durham to the list of acceptable materials in the Regional Municipality of Durham’s Green Bin program;
 - ii) With the reduction in garbage generation associated with Recommendation i), reduce the curbside garbage limit for the set out of garbage bags/cans from four (4) bags/cans every two weeks to three (3) bags/cans every two weeks with a communication and compliance plan providing appropriate resident education and support; and
 - iii) To accommodate the requirements of the Food and Organic Waste Policy Statement, Regional Council approve, in principle, the development of a Green Bin program for multi-residential buildings receiving Regional waste collection services.
- B) That Regional Council direct staff to amend By-Law #46-2011, A By-Law to Regulate the Provision of Waste Management Services Under the Jurisdiction of

the Regional Municipality of Durham, effective July 1, 2024 to reflect the above program changes; and

- C) That a copy of this report be distributed to Local Area Municipalities and the Ontario Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks York-Durham District Office for their information.
-

Report:

1. Purpose

- 1.1 This report outlines the proposed short-term and long-term solution to the Regional Municipality of Durham's (Region) organic waste management needs following the cancelation of Negotiated Request for Proposal (NRFP)-1080-2021 and requests authority for staff to make necessary improvements to the Region's current waste management programs to meet the Region's immediate organics management objectives, while the implementation strategies for the long-term plan are reviewed.

2. Background

- 2.1 At its meeting of June 29, 2022, Regional Council approved the recommendation in Report [#2022-COW-22](#) to cancel the Region's Mixed Waste Pre-sort and Anaerobic Digestion Facility (AD Project) procurement process for NRFP-1080-2021 due to its significant capital costs and future operating costs associated with uncertainties due to global inflation and supply chain risks.
- 2.2 This cancelation does not negate the Region's need for a sustainable organics management plan. The Region's short- and long-term needs for ongoing organics processing using Anaerobic Digestion (AD) and meeting the following waste management plan objectives continue to include:
- a. Compliance with legislative organics diversion requirements.
 - b. Addressing the service requirements of the Region's growing population.
 - c. Managing the capacity limitations of the Region's existing waste disposal infrastructure.
 - d. Increasing environmental sustainability and climate change impacts through an increase in overall diversion.

3. Previous Reports and Decisions

- 3.1 Report [#2019-COW-17](#) titled, 'Organics Management Next Steps and Updated Preliminary Business Case' adopted wet AD as the preferred technology for the Region's long term organics management plan to maximize diversion, including green bin organics and the organic fraction of mixed garbage wastes.
- 3.2 Report [#2022-COW-22](#) titled, 'Negotiated Request for Proposal Results for the Design, Build, Operate and Maintain Contract for a Mixed Waste Pre-sort and Anaerobic Digestion Facility' provided the rationale for Regional Council to cancel the procurement process for the AD Project. Section 2 of the report provides a detailed summary of Regional Council direction between 2018 and 2022 at key decision points in the AD Project development process.

4. Ontario Food and Organic Waste Policy Statement

- 4.1 Ontario's Food and Organic Waste Policy Statement (Policy Statement) requires municipalities to achieve:
- a. 70 per cent waste reduction and resource recovery of food and organic waste generated by single-family dwellings in urban settlement areas by 2023; and
 - b. 50 per cent waste reduction and resource recovery of food and organic waste generated at multi-residential properties by 2025.
- 4.2 It also encourages the diversion of the following materials through organics separation programs:
- a. Personal hygiene wastes;
 - b. Sanitary products;
 - c. Shredded paper (already accepted in Durham's green bin);
 - d. Additional paper fibre products (already accepted in Durham's green bin);
 - e. Compostable products and packaging;
 - f. Pet food (already accepted in Durham's green bin); and
 - g. Pet wastes.

- 4.3 The Policy Statement recognizes AD as a resource recovery system for sending recovered organics for further processing.
- 4.4 In 2021, the Region diverted 43 per cent of the available organics including leaf and yard waste materials in the overall single-family home waste stream. An Enhanced Green Bin and multi-residential program will help the Region achieve compliance with the Policy Statement requirements.

5. Process for Durham's Organics Management Plan

- 5.1 The next steps to move the Region's organics management plan forward comprise of short- and long-term processes. The short-term process provides operational continuity by securing third party organics processing capacity at a suitable AD facility beyond the end date of the current organics processing contract of June 30, 2024. The long-term process focuses on the future viability of the Region's AD Project. Regional staff will monitor the performance of the short-term organics management plan and adjust the long-term organics management plan requirements as appropriate.
- 5.2 Procurement for the short-term process includes a Request for Prequalification (RFPQ) followed by a Request for Tender (Tender) for wet AD processing of the Region's food and organic waste for a ten-year term. This term allows for the time to refine and implement a long-term organics management plan while meeting interim organics management requirements. A contract of such length will help to ensure competitive market pricing, cost certainty and service stability.
- 5.3 As part of the RFPQ the Region will explore the opportunities to retain, where feasible, the related environmental benefits from the diversion and/or processing of organics through the AD process, including any associated renewable natural gas (RNG) production which has been derived. The opportunity to retain title and ownership of such related RNG and/or other environmental attributes may provide additional benefits towards meeting the Region's corporate sustainability objectives and greenhouse gas (GHG) emission reduction targets (i.e., net zero GHG emissions for corporate operations by 2045). Assuming such opportunities are available (e.g., utilization of RNG in Regional operations through natural gas procurement program), they will be carefully assessed to ensure that they provide a reasonable, cost-effective means for achieving corporate sustainability objectives, while ensuring that the organics processing contract itself achieves the best value to taxpayers.

- 5.4 To further inform the Region on potential opportunities for obtaining RNG for use within the Region's natural gas procurement program, the Region has undertaken a parallel, non-binding Request for Information (RFI) process to collect information on various supplier contract options including possible terms and conditions (e.g. contract duration, minimum volume amounts), pricing and potential carbon reduction (RFI open until February 10, 2023). Any market information collected will assist staff in the assessment of any related vendor feedback as obtained through the RFPQ process noted above regarding the potential sharing of RNG and/or any related environmental benefits.
- 5.5 The Notice of Planned Procurement was issued on December 15, 2022. The RFPQ will be issued in 2023 followed by the tender to ensure a new processing contract is in place for July 1, 2024.

6. Enhanced Green Bin Program

- 6.1 Wet AD continues to be the Region's preferred organics management technology.
- 6.2 Wet AD will allow additional materials to be included in an Enhanced Green Bin program including diapers, personal sanitary products, incontinence products, pet waste, pet litter and, in some cases, compostable packaging.
- 6.3 Although wet AD technology is efficient at the separation of plastic film during processing and an enhanced Green Bin program will include materials with plastic film that can be separated by wet AD, staff recommend maintaining the requirement for 100 per cent compostable green bin liner bags, kraft paper bags or paper wrapping for organics. Maintaining compostable bag requirements will help reduce AD residue requiring disposal as waste, maximize the quality of digestate for further beneficial use, and is consistent with the federal Single-use Plastics Prohibition Regulations (SOR/2022-138). This requirement supports the environmental goals of Durham Region's Strategic Plan and Long-term Waste Management Plan.
- 6.4 The additional materials in an Enhanced Green Bin program represent the potential for approximately 10,000 annual tonnes being removed from the waste in garbage bags and diverted from the Durham York Energy Centre (DYEC). The additional diversion will preserve disposal capacity at the DYEC and assist the Region in meeting its Long-term Waste Management Plan target of diverting an additional 10 per cent organics from disposal by 2026.

- 6.5 An Enhanced Green Bin program will provide a significant service level improvement for residents, allowing the odorous items in the garbage to be collected weekly in the Green Bin instead of bi-weekly in the garbage.
- 6.6 A Promotion and Education campaign will be planned to e-launch the Enhanced Green Bin program to include details and the enhanced list of acceptable materials. Distribution of additional green bins may be a part of this program to support residents in accommodating larger volumes of material.
- 6.7 While Durham processes all green bin program materials collected in the Region, the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby collect the green bin materials in their respective municipalities. Regional staff will work with the City of Oshawa and the Town of Whitby to ensure the implementation of a coordinated Enhanced Green Bin program.

7. Multi-residential Enhanced Green Bin Program

- 7.1 The Region provides Blue Box and garbage collection to multi-residential buildings that meet the Region's requirements outlined in Schedule P of Waste Management By-law #46-2011. Multi-residential buildings that do not meet the requirements manage their waste with private contractors.
- 7.2 Durham does not have a multi-residential Green Bin program. Multi-residential organics represent the Region's largest opportunity for additional waste diversion beyond expanding the curbside Green Bin program. Currently, 415 multi-residential properties (25,961 units) receive municipal waste collection services as noted in Table 1 below. This housing stock is the Region's fastest growing housing sector.

Table 1: Multi-residential properties serviced by the Region (July 2022)

Municipality	# Multi-residential Properties Serviced	Total # of Individual Units Serviced
Oshawa	219	13,131
Whitby	76	4,207
Pickering	35	3,660
Ajax	34	3,124
Clarington	26	945
Uxbridge	15	511
Scugog	4	138
Brock	6	245
TOTAL	415	25,961

- 7.3 In 2021, food waste, diapers, personal hygiene products, incontinence products, pet waste and pet litter represented approximately 40 per cent of total waste generated by Durham's multi-residential sector.
- 7.4 A multi-residential Green Bin program will require a multi-year implementation plan for logistics including significant participation from property managers, particularly those in buildings that have limited storage capacity.
- 7.5 Multi-residential buildings currently under development will be informed of the upcoming changes with a request for appropriate accommodations. Organics management will be included in the future multi-residential development review process.
- 7.6 A communications plan will be developed to implement an enhanced Green Bin program including multi-residential customers.

8. Reducing the Curbside Garbage Bag Limit

- 8.1 The Enhanced Green Bin program will reduce the quantity of garbage requiring processing at the DYEC allowing a reduction in the current garbage bag limit for residential garbage set outs from four bags/cans every other week to three.
- 8.2 Curbside studies (surveys) conducted in the fall of 2022 determined that approximately 80 per cent of Durham residents set out three bags/cans or less.
- 8.3 Allowing for more materials to go in the Green Bin will provide residents with a convenient method to get rid of odorous waste weekly rather than every other week in the garbage. The reduction of the garbage bag/can limit from four to three will also encourage residents to put more organics in the Green Bin rather than in the garbage stream.
- 8.4 The Region will continue to offer additional, free garbage bag tags to residents that request and qualify for an exemption based on medical conditions and/or family size. Residents will still be able to purchase garbage bag tags.
- 8.5 Compliance with the three garbage bag limit will start with an education period and compliance efforts will be phased in to allow residents to adjust to the new set out limit. Staff will monitor the bag limit reduction to determine if accommodations for spring and fall clean-ups are required.
- 8.6 Prior to implementing the new limit, a communication campaign will be implemented to inform residents of the change and enhanced options to divert garbage will be undertaken.

9. Preserving Capacity at DYEC

- 9.1 The launch of an Enhanced Green Bin and multi-residential green bin program coupled with a reduction in the garbage bag/can limit is anticipated to decrease the waste tonnage being processed at the DYEC or requiring disposal at landfill. The Region continues to seek additional opportunities to optimize diversion programs thereby delaying future expansion requirements, including those involving managing organics. New and planned regulations at the Federal and Provincial level will also reduce garbage being sent to the DYEC. Part of these plans also include optimizing the design and operations at the Region's Waste Management Facilities, starting with the Oshawa Waste Management Facility.
- 9.2 It remains the Region's objective to delay expansion of the DYEC beyond 2030.

10. More Homes Built Faster Act (Bill 23)

- 10.1 Bill 23 sets housing targets for several lower tier municipalities in Ontario including the eight local area municipalities of Durham Region. In most cases, the Bill 23 targets are higher than targets currently in the Durham Growth Management Study.
- 10.2 The increased housing targets for Durham Region will result in higher demand for waste management services including waste diversion and disposal. The Region will need to ensure planning for future programs and infrastructure is adequate to accommodate higher population estimates.
- 10.3 In general, Bill 23 will reduce the Region's ability to predict local growth and the resulting impacts on Regional infrastructure. This uncertainty must be considered when planning the long-term organics management solution.

11. Long-term Organics Management Solution

- 11.1 The AD Project is the preferred long-term organics management solution for the Region. Council approved the AD Project as a necessary measure to address the Region's projected waste management needs in an environmentally responsible manner. The benefits of the AD Project remain:
 - a. **Renewable Natural Gas (RNG) and GHG Reduction:** Durham Region declared a climate emergency in 2020 and developed a Corporate Climate Action Plan (CCAP) to guide efforts to reduce greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions from Region operations. The AD Project would potentially provide significant GHG emission reductions for the Region, assuming produced RNG is utilized in Regional facilities displacing conventional natural gas requirements and not sold. Furthermore, internal utilization of RNG would displace conventional natural gas purchases and avoid related costs where the market for natural gas has become increasingly volatile in recent years. There is also the potential to avoid the federal carbon fuel surcharge tax with the blending of RNG for internal use.
 - b. **Legislative Compliance:** The AD Project will ensure the Region is compliant with anticipated regulations for banning organics from landfills and for recovering food waste and other organics.

- c. **Increased Waste Diversion:** The AD Project will help the Region divert over 70 per cent of its organic waste from curbside collection program to AD and at least 50 per cent from its multi-residential collection program.
- d. **Delay DYEC Expansion:** The AD Project will allow the Region to preserve capacity at the DYEC and delay the need for expansion.

12. Financial Implications

- 12.1 Staff estimates at this time that an enhanced Green Bin program will result in a net operating cost increase between \$0.4 million and \$1 million annually. Program costs will be finalized upon the date of implementation.
- 12.2 Staff is investigating costs for a multi-residential green bin program and will submit a further report that details the logistical and financial implications in 2023.

13. Relationship to Strategic Plan

- 13.1 This report aligns with/addresses the following strategic goals and priorities in the Durham Region Strategic Plan:
 - a. Goal 1.1 Accelerate the adoption of green technologies and clean energy solutions through strategic partnerships and investment
 - b. Goal 1.2 Increase waste diversion and resource recovery
 - c. Goal 1.4 Demonstrate leadership in sustainability and addressing climate change
 - d. Goal 5.1 Optimize resources and partnerships to deliver exceptional quality services and value

14. Conclusion

- 14.1 In the short-term, a 10-year term service contract for organic processing capacity is being planned to manage an Enhanced Green Bin program. To support this program, staff propose revising Waste Management By-law # 46-2011 to permit a wider range of material in the Green Bin program such as diapers and pet waste.
- 14.2 In addition, it is recommended to implement a source separated organics program for multi-residential properties serviced by the Regional Municipality of Durham for meeting Provincial multi-residential food and organic waste reduction requirements.

14.3 This report has been reviewed by the Legal Services Division of the Corporate Services Department and the Finance Department.

14.4 For additional information, contact: Gioseph Anello, Director, Waste Management Services, at 905-668-7711, extension 3445.

Respectfully submitted,

Original signed by:

John Presta, P.Eng. MPA
Commissioner of Works

Recommended for Presentation to Committee

Original signed by:

Elaine C. Baxter-Trahair
Chief Administrative Officer