

Working Group Response to the 70 King Street East Oshawa Proposal

Working Group Members; Diane Stephen
Alan Willison
John O'Boyle

On April 20th, 2023, The Heritage Oshawa Advisory Committee was asked for comment on the 2nd submission for Official Plan and Zoning By-Law Amendment for 70 King Street East, historically known as the Genosha Hotel. The Proposal, which will include the severance of the historically Ontario Heritage designated property, a 21 storey mixed use building on the North side of the property, will contain 198 apartments, ground floor commercial and a bridge across Mary Street to the City owned parking garage at 1 Mary Street and added levels to the Mary Street parking garage.

The 2nd submission also included an addendum, dated April 2023 to the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) final report dated December 6th, 2021;

- The HIA addendum “examines the differences between the 2014 to 2020 Provincial Policy

Statement policies regarding heritage and describes how the proposed development conserves.

and retains the cultural heritage value and interest of the former Genosha Hotel”.

- **The Working Group does not agree with this assessment**

1. Severance of the Heritage Property doesn't equal conservation and retention.
2. The proposed building is uncomplimentary to the existing Genosha Hotel
3. The proposed building will cover up the semi-circular arches at the ground level on the North Side of the Genosha Hotel, which marked the original ballroom and are included in the architectural attributes in the designation By-Law (See Attachments 1 and 2)

The HIA addendum explains that the design of the new building was chosen to contrast and accentuate the historical architecture of the Genosha Hotel.

- **The Working Group** believes that the current proposal is too much of a contrast to the The Genosha Hotel and finds that the design is uncomplimentary and actually diminishes the historical architectural features and attributes as noted in the designation by-law.

Other Questions, Concerns And Comments

- 1) The Working Group feels that it would be best to have a “Heritage Permit” in place for any projects including “Heritage Properties”, including the Genosha Hotel, as discussed at the Economic and Development Services Committee Report ED-23-62 from April 12th, 2023
- 2) what measures will be taken to keep the existing Genosha Hotel from collapsing into the construction pit/site that will have to be made to create a building so tall?
- 3) what measures will be taken to protect the façade of the Genosha Hotel during the construction of the proposed building and the added floors of the Municipal parking garage?

HTG-23-35

- 4) There are concerns regarding shadows from both the proposed building and the increased levels of the parking garage.
- 5) The working group is concerned that the views of the original Genosha Hotel will be restricted or diminished. (The proposed building is the focal point if you are looking from the South East corner of King and Mary St And there will be no view of the original building from Bond St.)
- 6) On Page 3 of the Schedule "A" of By-Law 70-2005 under "Heritage Attributes to be Protected and Conserved" the semi- circular arches on the North façade are stated as one of the architectural features to be preserved. Shall this proposal move forward how will the arches be preserved?
- 7) The working group finds that the proposal to be architecturally inconsistent to the existing Genosha Hotel. It is felt if this proposal moves forward it will be damaging to the "Heritage Property and the Historical Building that currently resides on it. The proposed building would be so out of place that it will make the existing buildings appear out of place.
- 8) The working Group feels that the ability to move freely between the existing Genosha Hotel and the Proposed Building constitutes an expansion of the existing Hotel. The working group would recommend a better symmetry between the existing building and the proposed addition.
- 10) The working group believes that many important parts of the actual plan have been excluded. We would like to see a more complete presentation.

In conclusion the 70 King St. working group would recommend, because of our responses to the presentation of April 20th, 2023 and our 10 additional questions, concerns and comments that the Heritage Oshawa Advisory Committee advise that this proposal not proceed in its present form.

ATTACHMENT:



By-Law 70-2005
of The Corporation of the City of Oshawa

being a by-law to designate the property known as the Genosha Hotel, located at 68 and 72 King Street East, as being of cultural heritage value or interest pursuant to the *Ontario Heritage Act, R.S.O. 1990, Chapter 0.18*.

Recitals:

1. Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act, R.S.O. 1990, Chapter 0.18*, authorizes the Council of a municipality to enact by-laws to designate real property, including all buildings and structures on it, to be of cultural heritage value or interest.
2. 1546382 Ontario Limited is the registered owner of the property, which contains the building known as the Genosha Hotel, located at 68 and 72 King Street East, in the City of Oshawa. The building was constructed in 1928 and has operated as a hotel and rooming house and has housed a bus terminal, radio station, taverns and a variety of offices and shops since its opening in 1929.
3. The Corporation of the City of Oshawa has provided notice to the Owner and to the Ontario Heritage Trust that it intends to designate this property under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
4. Notice of intention to designate this property has also been published in the *Oshawa This Week* newspaper (which has general circulation in the City of Oshawa) on the 31st day of March, 2004.
5. A notice of objection to the proposed designation was served by the Owner on the City Clerk on April 29, 2004. The Conservation Review Board held a hearing under the Act with respect to the Property on October 20, 2004.
6. The Conservation Review Board issued its report on December 3, 2004, recommending to the City that it designate the Property.

NOW THEREFORE IT BE ENACTED AND IT IS HEREBY ENACTED as a by-law of The Corporation of the City of Oshawa, by its Council, as follows:

1. The property, including all facilities, features and structures on it which are described in Schedule "A" to this By-Law, located at 68 and 72 King Street East, more particularly described as, North-West Corner of Mary Street & King Street East; Lt 6 N/S King St PI H50003 Oshawa; Lt 7 N/S King St PI H50003 Oshawa; Pt Lt 5 N/S King St PI H50003 Oshawa As In D275134 (Thirdly); Pt Lt 6 S/S Bond St PI H50003 Oshawa; Pt Lot 7 S/S Bond St PI H50003 Oshawa As In D275134 (Secondly); Oshawa is hereby designated as being of cultural heritage value or interest.

2. The reasons for designation of this property under the *Ontario Heritage Act* are set out in Schedule "A" to this by-law.
3. A copy of this by-law shall be registered against the property described above in the Land Registry and Land Titles Offices for the Land Registry Division of Whitby (No. 40).
4. The City Clerk is hereby authorized to serve a copy of this by-law on the Owner and on the Ontario Heritage Trust and to publish notice of the passing of this by-law in the *Oshawa This Week* newspaper.

By-Law read a first, second and third time and finally passed this thirteenth day of June, 2005.



Mayor



City Clerk

Schedule "A" to City of Oshawa By-law 70-2005

Passed this thirteenth day of June, 2005

Statement of Reasons for Designation and
Description of the Heritage Attributes of
The Genosha Hotel
68 and 72 King Street East
City of Oshawa

Reasons for Designation

The Genosha Hotel, being 68 and 72 King Street East, in the City of Oshawa is recommended for designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act, R.S.O. 1990, Chapter O.18* as being of cultural heritage value or interest. The specific reasons are as follows:

Cultural

The need to bring a first class hotel to Oshawa in the 1920's was part of the emerging identity of the town as a corporate centre. General Motors was in the midst of a modernizing and expansionist program and the future prospects for the town were good. The name, Genosha, is unique and culturally significant as it is derived by utilizing the first three letters of "General (Motors)" and the first four letters of "Oshawa", hence the name, "Genosha".

Historical

Built in 1929, The Genosha Hotel (the Genosha) was designed and built by owners J.W. Butler and Co., formerly with the Prince Arthur Hotel chain. The hotel offered luxury accommodation when it opened. The unfortunate timing of its inaugural year, coinciding with a severe downturn in the national economy and the ensuing depression, undermined its financial viability for several years. In spite of this circumstance, the Genosha was popular with the travelling public and proved to be a hub of community activities. Whether it was for a club meeting, family gathering, business luncheon, coffee, dinner or dancing, the Genosha was the venue of choice. It was the bus terminal, radio station and home to a variety of offices and shops. Due to the impact the building of Highway 401 in the 1960's had on the long distance traffic along King Street, the hotel suffered another downturn and eventually became a tavern and rooming house. Although the Genosha went through a period of decline, it now has the opportunity to relive its former glory and add to the revitalization of downtown Oshawa.

Page 2 of Schedule "A" to City of Oshawa By-law 70-2005

Contextual

Located at the north-west corner of Mary Street and King Street East, the building's overall massing coupled with its siting and setback from the street line assists in framing the intersection by providing strong urban edges and distinct contrast to the more modern buildings that surround it. The Genosha, along with the designated 1919 Regent Theatre (44-52 King Street East) and the 1928 Alger Building (35-37 King Street East) form a strong historical context.

Architectural

The Genosha Hotel is architecturally significant as an excellent example of Chicago Style design that is articulated by features with modest Art Deco influences.

It is visually divided into three sections: 1) a commercial street level section, once outlined with concrete or limestone but now marred by the herringbone cladding and the heavy wood banding, 2) an intermediate section of wall and window rhythms that are still intact, and 3) an attic or roof-line section that was once capped with more extensive cornices and parapets.

The hotel is a six-storey, rectangular, flat-roofed, buff brick clad building occupying a block of land stretching between Mary, Bond, Victoria and King Streets. The prominent entrance façade faces south to King Street East and was once marked by a prominent canopy. A two-storey wing exists on the north face of the building with an east-facing front façade.

The building contains a grid-like organization of window placements and wall surfaces with cornices and parapets in contrasting masonry material. The fenestration treatment for the openings includes an ornate combination of casement sashes with upper transoms. There are flat concrete or limestone lintels and lugsills.

Of interest are the vertical ribbons of projecting brick that simulate columnar features. The top floor contains ornamental balconettes. The roofline is trimmed with heavy, light coloured dentiling on the south and east face with a short tumbuck at each corner.

Another heritage attribute of the building is found on its north elevation which entails semi-circular arches at the ground level marking the original ballroom, which have been recently filled in with concrete blocks.

The designation applies only to the exterior portion of the building. Interior features are not included as part of the designation.

Page 3 of Schedule "A" to City of Oshawa By-law 70-2005

Heritage Attributes to be Protected and Conserved

The specific attributes that contribute to the heritage value of the Genosha Hotel and that should be preserved include:

- The overall massing of the 6-storey rectangle, flat-roofed building with 1- and 2-storey brick additions on the north façade
- Three distinct divisions to the building, specifically including the following:
 1. Commercial Street Level section
 - Semi-circular arches at street level on north façade
 - Size and proportion of the street level display windows on the south and east façades
 - Note that this designation excludes the herringbone cladding
 2. Intermediate section
 - Windows:
 - Grid-like organization of window placements (12 windows across by 5 windows down) across entire intermediate section of building
 - Window design or suitable substitution (combination of casement sashes in 4 divisions, 2 side-by-side in 6 sections, with an upper transom-like band)
 - Lintels and lugsills in contrasting materials of limestone or concrete
 - Central frontispiece of two columns of windows with doors and balconettes on 6th floor
 - Shared recessed lintels on 6th floor balcony windows
 - Unpainted variegated buff-yellow brick on south and east façades
 - Light gray stucco on north and west façades
 - 7 ornamental balconettes on south and east façades
 - vertical ribbons of projecting brick simulating columns (some terminate in a loop while others drop until they intersect a limestone rectangle then terminate at the first floor)
 3. Attic or Roof-line section
 - Dentiling at roof-line in contrasting materials on south and east façades and on 2-storey addition
 - Projecting cap at southwest corner and remnants of same at southeast corner

ATTACHMENT 2:

